



Graph 7 The space of the arts and social science faculties: analysis of correspondences: plane of the first and second axes of inertia - individuals

Note: The graph shows the distribution of individuals (teachers of higher education in Paris) in the factorial plane outlined by the first two axes as established by factorial analysis of the correspondences (see note on pp. 69-72 concerning this method). The graph showing the distribution of the properties attached to these individuals is on p. 80. The first axis outlines the opposition between those who hold full university power (on the right) and those who enjoy other forms of power or prestige; the second distinguishes tenured teachers from those teachers who are younger and lack institutional recognition. The third axis, which isn't shown here, modulates this by differentiating the main university Establishment from more obscure specialists

Notes

PREFACE TO THE ENGLISH EDITION

- 1 P. Bourdieu, 'Célibat et condition paysanne', *Etudes rurales*, April-September 1962, pp. 32-136.
- 2 The repudiation is of the Chicago school type of sociology of professions. [Tr.]
- 3 Because of this, the authors find themselves reduced (more or less completely, depending on the readers' information) to the works bearing their name and are stripped of all the social properties associated with their position in their field of origin, that is, the most institutionalized dimension of their authority and their symbolic capital (although prefaces written by authors placed within the field may serve, if necessary, to effect the transfer necessary to restore their endangered symbolic capital . . .). The freedom which is thus left to the reader's judgement is quite relative because of the fact that the effects of authority can continue to operate through the medium of the solidarity obtaining between holders of homologous positions in different national scientific fields, and in particular between the dominant, who can profit from the power which they exercise over the circulation of translations and the agencies of consecration in order to operate international transfers of academic power and also to control the access to the national market of products liable to threaten their own production. On the other hand, this relative freedom has as its counterpart the danger of misunderstanding and *allodoxia* which is entailed by ignorance of the context: thus it is, for instance, that some essayists come to eclipse the stars of the first magnitude from whom they borrow the very source of their radiance.
- 4 There is no lack of sociologists, historians or anthropologists who, unable to adopt towards their own world the detached scrutiny of the foreigner, will find in this book, which is the product of a methodical effort to achieve this scrutiny without losing the benefits of familiarity,

- an opportunity to reinforce their native confidence in their own world – as expressed in all naivety in certain studies of France and its universities by foreign authors. The paradigm of this sociology which enthrones ethnocentrism as method (and which can be the product of émigrés needing to justify, in their own eyes, the fact that they have emigrated) is a work by Terry Clark which measures the French university against a set of arbitrary criteria which are no more than the idealized traits of the American university (cf. T. Clark, *Prophets and Patrons: The French University and the Emergence of the Social Science*, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 1973).
- 5 At each point of the analysis, as regards, for instance, the distance between the academic field and political or economic power – which, it would seem, is (or at least was) for historical reasons greater than in any other country – one ought to examine what is variable and what is invariant and try to discover in the variations of the parameters used for the model the sources of the variations observed in reality.
 - 6 I think that the strategy adopted on this point by the translator, to give carefully chosen English or American equivalents for the words designating specific institutions, while retaining the French words in parentheses, should render this work of transposition easier.
 - 7 Simone de Beauvoir, 'La Pensée de droite aujourd'hui', *Les Temps modernes*, nos 112–13 and 114–15, 1985, pp. 1539–75 and 2219–61. [Tr.]
 - 8 The University of Vincennes, created after 1968, crystallized the new intellectual lifestyle and established within the university itself, thereby greatly scandalizing the defenders of the old university, a version of intellectual life which in other times would have been relegated to intellectual reviews or bohemian cafés.
 - 9 Since I am conscious that the analysis of the academic field which is presented in this book would lose a great deal of the interest which it can offer all those who are interested in the cultural production of France over the last twenty years if they were unable to make out the space of the works and the tendencies whose shadows loom behind the space of the positions, I have decided to spell out the names of the academics studied instead of leaving them in the semi-anonymity of their initials as I had done in the French edition in order to avoid the effects of denunciation or of over-interpretation which, with the passage of time (twenty years after the study) and the distance gained by the foreign observer, should today be attenuated.
 - 10 'L'Homme est mort' was a phrase of Foucault's in *Les Mots et les choses*, Paris, 1966 (*The Order of Things*, London, 1970). [Tr.]
 - 11 Cf. P. Bourdieu, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*, trans. R. Nice, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 1984, pp. 494ff.

- 12 'Oblates': see note 31 to chapter 2. [Tr.]
- 13 It is a singularity absolutely analogous to that of the nineteenth-century academic institution entrusted with training and consecrating painters, and, particularly, the extraordinary concentration in the hands of the great dignitaries of the Academy of the power of consecration and, thereby, access to the market, which goes a long way towards explaining why the revolution which gave birth to modern painting, with Manet and impressionism, appeared in France earlier than elsewhere.
- 14 One tends to forget that the student revolt of May 1968 was triggered by a clash between students and the academic authorities over freedom of access to female students' accommodation.
- 15 These 'minor heresiarchs' are Jean Baudrillard, Jean-François Lyotard, among others. [Tr.]

Chapter 1 A 'Book for Burning'?

- 1 I became fully conscious of this problem when several of my early readers asked me to 'give examples', in the case of analyses from which I had deliberately excluded all 'anecdotal' information, however familiar to 'usually well-informed sources' – the very information that journalists or popular essayists are most eager to reveal.
- 2 *Habitus* is a system of shared social dispositions and cognitive structures which generates perceptions, appreciations and actions. Cf. P. Bourdieu, *Outline of a Theory of Practice*, Cambridge, 1978. [Tr.]
- 3 Cf. C. C. Gillespie, *Science and Policy in France at the End of the Old Régime*, Princeton, Princeton University Press, 1980, pp. 290–330.
- 4 Among others, we could quote the most recent representative of this tendency, Hervé Coureau-Bégarie, whose analyses of the *Ecole des Annales* betray quite ingenuously the repressed violence elicited by intellectual rejection reinforced by provincialism: 'Thus the new historians presented a *coherent project*, ideologically *adapted* to the audience it was designed for. . . . It is this expansion which explains the success of the new historians. They were then able to *mount an attack* on publishers and the media *in order* to obtain what Régis Debray calls "social visibility"' (H. Coureau-Bégarie, *Le Phénomène nouvelle histoire*, Paris, Economica, 1983, pp. 247 and 248).
- 5 Bernard Pivot, host of the weekly television show *Apostrophes*, devoted to literary and cultural discussion, was criticized by Régis Debray, presidential adviser, and author of a book denouncing intellectuals, *Les Scribes*, in a notorious interview. Cf. also H. Hamon et P. Rotmann, *Les Intellocrates. Expédition en Haute Intelligentsia*, Paris, Ramsay, 1981. [Tr.]

- 6 The Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes is a research institute for social science, not integrated into the main university system. [Tr.]
- 7 *Le Nouvel Observateur* is an authoritative yet glossy left-wing political and cultural weekly magazine. [Tr.]
- 8 J. Bouveresse, *Le Philosophe chez les autophages*, Paris, Minuit, 1984, pp. 93ff.
- 9 In a kind of symbolic *auto-da-fé*, probably not deliberately orchestrated, all the Viennese newspapers observed the strictest silence about *Die Fackel* throughout Karl Kraus's lifetime.
- 10 We know that *The Interpretation of Dreams*, which Freud considered his most important scientific work, conceals, beneath the manifest logic of the scientific treatise, a latent discourse in which Freud, through a series of personal dreams, undertakes an analysis of his inextricably tangled relationships with his father, with politics and with the university. Cf. especially Carl E. Schorske, *Fin de Siècle Vienna: Politics and Culture*, New York, Alfred A. Knopf, 1980, pp. 181-207.
- 11 The reader will find below, in chapter 3, a detailed description of the process of construction of this population. The characteristics of the representative sample which was used as a basis for the analysis of the ensemble of the faculties (except pharmacy) are described in chapter 2. The sources used in these two surveys are described in appendix 1.
- 12 The Conseil Consultatif des Universités (CCU), the Universities Consultative Committee, is the official organization advising government on university policy and controlling appointments of tenured professors. [Tr.]
- 13 The *agrégation* is a competitive examination originally designed to provide select recruitment to tenured teaching posts in secondary education, but was already in the period discussed by Bourdieu frequently a passport to teaching in higher education. [Tr.]
- 14 I cannot regret strongly enough not having kept a *research diary* which would have shown, better than any declaration, the role of empirical work in the progressive accomplishment of the break with first-hand experience. But a reading of the list of sources used (see appendix 1) should at least give an idea of the work of controlled recollection which is the motivating difference between ordinary experience and scholarly experience.
- 15 The INSEE (Institut National de la Statistique et des Etudes Economiques) is the National Institute for Statistical and Economic Surveys. [Tr.]
- 16 *Concours* are competitive examinations for a limited number of places, especially for candidates wishing to study at a *grande école*. Students admitted to a *grande école* have their fees paid and receive a generous grant. The *grandes écoles* are strongly contrasted to the ordinary French universities, where any student with the *baccalauréat* (18-plus school-

- leaving certificate) may enrol. The *grandes écoles* include the Ecole Normale Supérieure (ENS) for teachers, the Ecole Polytechnique and the Ecole Centrale for engineers, the Ecole Nationale d'Administration for higher civil servants, and the Ecole des Hautes Etudes Commerciales (HEC) for business managers. These *grandes écoles* are roughly equivalent to Oxford and Cambridge in the UK or the 'Ivy League' universities in the USA. [Tr.]
- 17 We should undertake an extended critique of the effect of naturalization, which is particularly active in demography, since it bestows on certain parameters (age, sex or even matrimonial status), and on studies which manipulate them without any other form of testing, the appearance of absolute 'objectivity'. In more general terms, and yet without expecting to discourage the compulsive repetition of studies tending to reduce history to biological or geographical or similar kinds of nature, it would be worth describing the form which this effect of dehistoricization takes in each of the social sciences, from ethnology, when it pays homage to verbal analogies with the natural sciences, to history itself when it seeks in the 'motionless history' of the soil and the climate that substance whose historical movements are supposed to be merely contingent features.
- 18 We cannot exclude the possibility that scientific analysis itself might exercise a theoretical effect sufficient to transform the ordinary vision of the field.
- 19 A *normalien* is a student or graduate of the Ecole Normale Supérieure, a *grande école* which originally trained elite teachers for the *agrégation* and titular posts in secondary teaching, but it now tends to produce university teachers. [Tr.]
- 20 An *agrégé* is a holder of the *agrégation*. Both titles are commonly considered an intellectual honour, independently of the posts then obtained. [Tr.]
- 21 A. W. Gouldner, 'Cosmopolitans and locals: toward an analysis of latent social rules', *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 2 December 1957, pp. 281-307.
- 22 B. Clark, 'Faculty organization and authority', in T. F. Lunsford (ed.), *The Study of Academic Administration*, Boulder, Colorado, Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education, 1963, pp. 37-51, and 'Faculty cultures', in *The Study of Campus Culture*, Boulder, Colorado, Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education, 1963.
- 23 J. W. Gustad, 'Community consensus and conflict', *The Educational Record*, Fall 1966.
- 24 L. Wittgenstein, *Philosophical Remarks*, Oxford, Blackwell, 1975, p. 181, quoted by J. Bouveresse, *Le Mythe de l'intériorité*, Paris, Minuit, 1976.

- 25 We will restrict ourselves to these rather unrealistic cases, which are too 'pure', since we cannot study individual cases, which would inevitably seem to be tendentious character assassinations, although only these would allow us to demonstrate the most typical strategies of this rhetoric of self-legitimation and show that the generic and specific characteristics of the position occupied both in the university field and in the specialized sub-field are expressed there, usually in a highly euphemistic manner, which is none the less perfectly transparent to people in the know.
- 26 Historicist or sociological relativism, which invokes the insertion of the research worker in the social world in order to question his ability to accede to a transhistorical truth, nearly always ignores insertion in the scientific field, and the correlative interests, thus denying itself any possibility of control over what is the specific mediation through which all determinisms operate.
- 27 Cf. R. Boudon, 'L'intellectuel et ses publics: les singularités françaises', in J.-D. Reynaud and Y. Grafmeyer (eds), *Français qui êtes-vous?*, Paris, Documentation Française, 1981, pp. 464-80.
- 28 The fact that the principal argument sustaining this discourse – the French hierarchy is different from the international hierarchy, the international hierarchy is the only scientific one, therefore the French hierarchy is non-scientific – remains latent even in a text of scientific pretensions shows one of the fundamental properties of the most characteristic polemical procedures used in struggles within the intellectual field: exploiting a bias shared by a whole group, the strategies of defamation aiming to ruin the symbolic credit of competitors proceed by more or less slanderous *insinuations* which would not usually survive being made completely explicit.
- 29 P. Bourdieu, 'Le Marché des biens symboliques', *L'Année sociologique*, 22, 1971, pp. 49-126.
- 30 This struggle may not be apparent as such, and a particular agent or group of agents may threaten the credit of other members of the field by their very existence (for example, by imposing new modes of thought and expression, and criteria of evaluation favourable to their own productions), without setting themselves up consciously as rivals, even less as enemies, and without resorting to strategies deliberately directed against them.
- 31 We ought to analyse the procedures of spontaneous semiotics and statistics through which a practical intuition of positions occupied in the distribution of specific capital is constituted, and especially the deciphering and calculating of the spontaneous or institutionalized indices of positions occupied; and also the mechanisms of inhibition or denial of truth, such as all forms of mutual-admiration society, as well as all compensation and substitution strategies, such as university trade-unionism and politics,

- which offer favourable ground for the strategies of dual identity and dual language favoured by the use of infinitely extensible 'concepts' such as 'workers', or the transfer of words and modes of thought borrowed from working-class conflicts.
- 32 One of the factors permitting the scrambling of hierarchies is the division into disciplines and, within these, into specializations which, although hierarchized, offer autonomous hierarchies.
- 33 L'Institut de France, the French Institute, comprises the Académie Française and the other academies for arts and sciences. [Tr.]
- 34 The CNRS (Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, the National Centre for Scientific Research), is the official organization funding research posts and laboratories. It is more powerful and influential in most cases than the research effort of individual university departments. [Tr.]
- 35 A *vacataire* is a researcher on a temporary contract, as opposed to full-time, tenured staff, or staff seconded on full pay from university posts. [Tr.]
- 36 Ignorance of this fundamental Weberian distinction is not limited to the layman, as we can see from the fact that 'sociologists' can reproach the analysis of cultural practices with recording *the fact* of the lesser legitimacy or the illegitimacy of the subordinate classes (for a criticism of this error, see P. Bourdieu, J.-C. Chamboredon and J.-C. Passeron, *Le Métier de sociologue*, Paris, Mouton, 1968, p. 76).
- 37 The Collège de France is a prestigious institute of higher education, founded by François I in 1530; it provides public lectures and seminars, but is not integrated in the main university system (no examinations are set and no diplomas are awarded). [Tr.]
- 38 On all these points, the reader may consult, apart from the classic debate among logicians on the proper name and operators of individuation (Russell, Gardiner, Quine, Strawson, etc.) and the reflections of Lévi-Strauss in *The Savage Mind*, the excellent analysis of J.-C. Pariente, *Le Langage et l'individuel*, Paris, Colin, 1973.
- 39 We might thus contrast the *agent*, defined by the finite set of properties operative within the field, with the pre-constructed *individual*.
- 40 On the role of spatio-temporal relations in the identification of individuals, see P. F. Strawson, *Individuals: An Essay in Descriptive Metaphysics*, London, Methuen, 1959.
- 41 Raymond Polin and Frédéric Deloffre are philosophy and philology professors at the Sorbonne noted for their strongly conservative stance in 1968 and after. [Tr.]
- 42 We could also return to the problem of exemplification: doesn't the choice of Lévi-Strauss as an example of the constructed class of 'great masters', defined by the occupation of a determined area of the

- constructed space, demolish the whole enterprise of construction, by encouraging or authorizing the reader to reintroduce the properties of the empirical individual? But the choice of an empirical individual chosen at random would be no more significant. Nor would the choice of the individual most saturated with the typical properties of the constructed population, which would no doubt represent the least disadvantageous realization of the notion of the 'ideal type'.
- 43 If I was not afraid of indulging in narcissistic complacency, I would evoke the question of contamination of the researcher's doxic viewpoint by his epistemic viewpoint. Or the problems posed practically by belonging to the empirical space which we try to subject to observation: feelings of betrayal, of disloyal manipulation (seeing without being seen), which admit and invite rejection, anguish at confrontation and fear of *bodily* contact, 'face to face' ('We keep bumping into Mr Siegfried Löwy', said Karl Kraus), etc. [Kraus refers to Löwy as the archetype of the fashionable journalist. (Tr.)]
- 44 Cf. C. Lévi-Strauss, *The Savage Mind*, London, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1968.
- 45 I would merely remind anyone who considers this *analysis* to be a personal vision how much room is taken up, quite logically in a world dominated by *symbolic capital*, by all the strategies aiming to amass *credit* or reduce the credit of others (calumny, disparagement, slander, eulogy, criticism in the various senses of the word).
- 46 It can happen that the most 'synoptic' concept can be associated with an empirical viewpoint (as in the case of the *petty bourgeoisie*). The break between epistemic usage and ordinary usage is then especially urgent.
- 47 On polyonymy as it is methodically used in *Don Quixote* to express the plurality of possible viewpoints on the person, see L. Spitzer, 'Linguistic perspectivism in the Don Quixote', *Linguistics and Literary History*, New York, Russell & Russell, 1962.
- 48 J. R. Searle, *Speech Acts*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1969. The history of art and literature themselves, where each new system of conventions shows up the relative truth, that is, the arbitrariness of the previous system of conventions, parallels the work of novelists like Alain Robbe-Grillet and Robert Pinget (especially in *L'Apocryphe*), who, by pointing out what was false in the contract between the novelist and the reader, and especially in the coexistence of declared fiction and a search for the impression of reality, establish fiction as fiction, including the fiction of a reality where its fiction is truly constructed.
- 49 To say that only a scientific criterion can challenge scientific work will tempt the defenders of essay-writing to cry 'terrorism'. And the sociologist will thus see himself accused of being either too weak, and too easy to refute, or too strong, and irrefutable.

- 50 This does not signify that a strictly 'literary' research cannot find a scientific justification. Thus, as Bateson remarks on the subject of the ethnologist, the evocative power of style constitutes one of the unsurpassable forms of scientific achievement when it has to objectify the relevant features of a social configuration and thereby to reveal the principles of the systematic appraisal of a historic necessity: when the historian of the Middle Ages [Georges Duby] evokes, through the power of language itself, the isolation and the desolation of the peasants who take refuge in oases of cleared land, who are prey to all sorts of terror, he is attempting above all to reproduce for the reader, in and through words capable of producing an impression of reality, the renewal of vision which he had to operate, against the screen-concepts and the intellectual reflex actions, to arrive at a correct understanding of the strangeness of Carolingian culture. We could say as much of the sociologist who may have to alternate the awkward machinery of conceptualization, inseparable from the construction of the object, with the search for stylistic effects designed to recapture the constructed and unitary experience of a lifestyle or of a way of thinking.
- 51 See E. Benveniste, *Problèmes de linguistique générale*, Paris, Gallimard, 1966, pp. 239, 242, 245, 249.
- 52 A UER (*unité d'enseignement et de recherche*) is an education and research unit. After the university reforms of 1969, universities, which had been large, loose agglomerations of a small number of powerful faculties, were reorganized into a greater number of smaller, semi-independent UERs. [Tr.]
- 53 It is clear that the redefinition of subordinate posts and their concomitant pedagogical interests must be set in the context not only of the transformation of the social and scholarly characteristics of the teachers but also of the profound modifications of the conditions of service of their careers, which have been caused by the transformation of the number and social status of their student public, in such a way that a description of the job and its representation, like the one which we shall propose below, which for the purposes of comparison and comprehension inevitably uses the previous state of the system as reference, tends to exaggerate signs of inadaptation and describe unfavourably the practices and the interests elicited by the new demand.
- 54 L. Wittgenstein, *Philosophical Remarks*, Oxford, Blackwell, 1975, p. 58.

Chapter 2 The Conflict of the Faculties

- 1 On the structure of the field of power as a space of the positions of power occupied, according to their different kinds of capital, by the various fractions of the dominant class, with at one pole the economically subordinate but culturally dominant fractions (artists, intellectuals,

- professors of arts and science) and at the other pole the economically dominant but culturally subordinate fractions (managers or executives of the public and private sector), see P. Bourdieu, *Distinction*, tr. R. Nice, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 1984; and, for a more detailed analysis of the temporally dominant sector of the field of power, see also P. Bourdieu and M. de Saint-Martin, 'Le patronat', *Actes de la recherche en sciences sociales*, 20-1, March-April 1978, pp. 3-82.
- 2 Everything leads us to suppose that the schism between academics and independent writers or intellectuals is much less marked than between the wars, or at the end of the nineteenth century, because of the fact that it has to some extent moved into the heart of the university field, since the university has opened its doors to writer-professors or journalist-professors as a result of the growth of the professorial body linked to the expansion of the student population and the concomitant changes in recruitment procedures. A structural history and a comparative sociology of the university field should concentrate especially on these variations at different moments and in different societies of the social distance between the two fields (which can be measured by different indices, such as the number of movements from one field to another, the frequency of simultaneous tenure of positions in both fields, the social distance - in terms of academic origins, etc. - between the two populations, the frequency of meetings, institutionalized or otherwise, etc.), and the social effects which can be related, in the two fields, to these variations.
 - 3 A. Girard, *La Réussite sociale en France, ses caractères, ses lois, ses effets*, Paris, Presses Universitaires de France, 1961, pp. 158-9. No one is more aware than I am of the insufficiency of the statistical bases of this comparison. But it seems to me that, in this case as in others, the need to take into account everything which the milieu being analysed owes to its position in a surrounding space is an urgent obligation, and that it is better to mark at least roughly the position occupied by the university field in the field of power and in the social field overall, rather than ignorantly record its effects in an analysis whose superficial correctness is only a result of the deceptive limits of a faultily constructed object.
 - 4 As the editors of this *Directory* observe, this work gives the state of the teaching body in 1966, because of the time lag in recording new appointments. As for the 1970 *Directory*, it now only gives, for each university establishment, a list of *unités d'enseignement et de recherche* (UER), with the names of their directors. We therefore resorted to lists obtained from the ministry for the year 1970 which allowed us to check the sample and take into account appointments made between 1966 and

- the time of the enquiry. (All through the analysis - even when it applied to a more recent period - we took care to preserve the terms which were in use in 1967, such as 'faculty', since replaced by 'university', or 'dean', replaced by 'Director of UER'.)
- 5 A comparison between professors of the different faculties should take into account the rate of growth of the populations of teachers (and students) since the 1950s. The various faculties are not, if we may say so, at the same stage of evolution: whereas the science faculties had their period of maximum growth around the years 1955-60 and started to retrench around 1970, the arts faculties only started to recruit teachers heavily after 1960 and the law faculties around 1965. It follows that the same diplomas do not always have the same value in the different faculties. For instance, in 1968, the science faculties were in a phase of retrenchment, appointment to a full lectureship being made only after a relatively long period (six to seven years), whereas in the arts, where expansion was continuing, the waiting period was shorter (this is no doubt partly explicable by the fact that assistant lecturers in the arts did not have tenure; contrary to assistant lecturers in science, they could only be retained through promotion to the post of lecturer). In a similar way, conditions of access to the post of professor were no doubt very unevenly affected by the effects of the growth of the teaching body.
 - 6 Rather than multiply examples of the rather monotonous argument used by the professors interviewed to rebut political or trade-union questions, we will fall back on quoting one professor from the faculty of medicine who spells out the principle quite plainly: 'I assure you that I have not . . . I don't think I'm avoiding the issue, but I don't think that you can classify me, I'm unclassifiable, anyway, because I never wanted to join any party. . . . You know, I think it was Jean Guilton who said that . . . "There are people whose commitment is to remain uncommitted".' But, rather than such attacks on the questionnaire, it is this reply from a professor known to belong to the Communist Party that we must quote, because it presents overtly the scientific and ethical principles which led us to note only those political opinions which were publicly displayed: 'I have said that I will not reply to these enquiries. My opinions are public knowledge. I don't hide them. But I will not reply to the enquiry. I repeat, I will not reply to this enquiry.' (There is a truly fascinating account of reactions to a - somewhat indefensible - questionnaire by E. C. Ladd and S. M. Lipsett on American professors in the work of S. Lang, *The File*, New York, Heidelberg and Berlin, Springer-Verlag, 1981.)
 - 7 The *Bottin mondain* is the French (high) society directory. [Tr.]
 - 8 We analysed, for the faculties of science and medicine alone (where we had at our disposal the information for 58 and 97 per cent of the

- samples), more detailed information on the family of origin (father's qualifications, mother's profession and qualifications, profession and qualifications of paternal and maternal grandfathers and grandmothers) and on the present family (profession and qualifications of spouse).
- 9 A *lycée* is the equivalent of a British grammar school or American state high school. In France as in Britain, opting out of the state education system in favour of private schooling generally supposes an upper-class income. But in France motivation is also frequently religious. Most private schools are Roman Catholic, in overt opposition to the constitutionally non-confessional state system. [Tr.]
 - 10 The *concours général* is a nationwide competition where the best pupils in the *baccalauréat* (18-plus school-leaving certificate) have their examination scripts judged for a national prize in each subject. [Tr.]
 - 11 Only part of the information gathered on this point was usable in the comparative study of professors of the different faculties, since the syllabuses, the competitive examinations, the examinations and the qualifications are profoundly non-comparable and can only be used for purposes of comparison within each faculty, for instance, between disciplines (although these comparisons themselves are rendered difficult, in many cases, by the relative incompatibility of the disciplines and also by the small size of the numbers involved in the sample). Among the data not used, we could mention, for instance, for arts and science, the establishment attended to study for the competitive entrance examination to the ENS or for a degree, the rank obtained in the entrance competition and age on entry, age on passing the *agrégation*, age when appointed assistant lecturer, when appointed professor, when obtaining doctorate, etc., or, for medicine, age when appointed junior hospital doctor and examination grade, age when appointed resident hospital doctor and examination grade, age when appointed assistant, consultant, professor, status as clinical head (major or minor, young or old, etc.), which no doubt constitutes a decisive element of specific social capital and whose choice seems to depend considerably on inherited social capital.
 - 12 Without using it in our analysis, we were able to examine membership of the Council for Higher Education, the University council, and general editorship of series for the Presses Universitaires de France.
 - 13 We also examined membership of foreign academies, honorary doctorates (and, for the arts faculties, the number of books and articles published). We had to reject an item as apparently simple as the number of articles or books published (to avoid comparing the non-comparable, ignoring the differences separating their objects, their methods, their results, the productions of the different categories of producers, according to generation, faculty, subject, etc.).
 - 14 The Académie Française (French Academy) was founded by Richelieu

- in 1634 and is an elite body of only forty distinguished literary figures. [Tr.]
- 15 The *Petit Larousse* is a household reference dictionary, including brief biographical notes on famous people. [Tr.]
 - 16 We could not use the 'intellectual' prizes, extremely numerous and disparate, which could not be satisfactorily codified without a preliminary study.
 - 17 Government ministers in France are free to appoint their own specialist advisers, who need not be civil servants. [Tr.]
 - 18 ENA, the Ecole Nationale d'Administration (National School for Administration), is a *grande école* which, like Sciences Po., recruits postgraduate students through its competitive entrance examination, rather than undergraduates; the ENA trains higher state officials. The HEC, the Ecole des Hautes Etudes Commerciales (another *grande école*), is France's top business school. The Ecole Polytechnique is the most prestigious engineering school. Its origins were military, but now it mainly supplies the upper echelons of industrial and business management. *Ecoles intellectuelles* and *écoles du pouvoir* are intellectual schools and establishment schools. This is Bourdieu's own classification of the *grandes écoles* into those serving the academic field (the ENS) and those serving the field of power (the ENA, HEC, Polytechnique, Centrale, etc.). [Tr.]
 - 19 We did not use membership of the Economic and Social Council, which was too infrequent.
 - 20 The structure of the different institutions of higher education distributed according to the social or academic characteristics of the students or pupils which frequent them correspond quite exactly, in all cases where verification is possible, to the structure of the same institutions distributed according to the social and the academic characteristics of the teachers and lecturers: thus it is that the students more often have their origins in the dominant class or, within that class, in the economically more privileged fractions, such as industrialists and liberal professions, in the faculties of medicine and law than in the arts and science faculties. Moreover, we know that the faculties of medicine and law lead to professions of a higher rank in the economic hierarchy than the science and arts faculties, whose products are to a large extent destined to teach. We could build a rich epistemological and social commentary around the fact that it is sufficient to substitute the socio-logical order, that is to say university institute of technology (IUT), science, arts, law, medicine, pharmacy, for the order habitually adopted in official statistics: law, arts, science, medicine, pharmacy, IUT, and to proceed to an analogous operation on the level of the socio-professional categories, those two ordered in spite of common sense, in order to perceive a

- more or less constant structure in the distributions (the rare discordances then assuming remarkable prominence) (cf. Ministère de l'Éducation Nationale, Service Central de la Statistique et de la Conjoncture, 'Les étudiants dans les universités, année scolaire 1967-68', *Statistiques des enseignements, tableaux et informations*, 5-2, 67-8, March 1968).
- 21 *Fondamentalistes* ('fundamentalists') are non-clinical medical staff engaged in pure research. [Tr.]
- 22 The data collected for a proportion (58 per cent) of professors of science and for the professors of medicine allow us to suppose that the hierarchy would be the same if we took into account the profession of the grandparents, paternal and maternal, or, because of the tendency towards homogamy, the professional status of the wife, with, for the arts and science faculties, a high percentage of teachers and, on the other side, a high percentage of doctors and non-working wives.
- 23 The Ecole Normale d'Instituteurs is a teacher-training college for primary schoolteachers; entrance is competitive. [Tr.]
- 24 Everything seems to indicate that the subjective and objective significance of declared membership of the Roman Catholic Church varies in frequency according to the whole of the faculty or the discipline and, secondarily, according to the more or less scientific and 'modernist' content of the discipline.
- 25 On this point as on so many others, whole monographs would be needed in order to determine the proportion of their salary in their global income, and the nature of their supplementary resources, which are themselves obviously connected to the structure of their *time-economy*. As regards university potential, extra lessons can be a source of considerable income, as can the royalties on bestselling textbooks (whose variations should be studied from faculty to faculty). None the less, the indirect *bonuses* must increase substantially as one moves from science to medicine.
- 26 Academic posts in France correspond roughly as follows to Anglo-Saxon ones:

FRANCE	UK	USA
<i>professeur</i>	professor	professor and chairman
<i>maître de conférences</i>	senior lecturer	professor
<i>maître-assistant</i>	lecturer	associate professor
<i>assistant</i>	assistant lecturer	assistant professor

[Tr.]

- 27 Cf. J. Nettelbeck, *Le Recrutement des professeurs d'université*, Paris, Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, 1979, roneotyped, pp. 80ff (statistical appendix).

- 28 On the financial consequences, as regards the sum of salary acquired during a whole career, and disparities between careers, cf. A. Tiano, *Les Traitements des fonctionnaires*, Paris, Genin, 1957, especially pp. 172ff.
- 29 The data collected for science and medicine allow us to suppose that the proportion of top grades in the *baccalauréat* follows the same pattern.
- 30 Sciences, Po, the Institut des Sciences Politiques; recruiting only postgraduates. Graduation usually ensures a top administrative post. [Tr.]
- 31 The original meaning of 'oblate' is a child from a poor family entrusted to a religious foundation to be trained for the priesthood. Bourdieu borrows the religious term to suggest the intensity of institutional loyalty felt by the teacher of humble origins who owes his whole education, culture, training and career to the state educational system. [Tr.]
- 32 We ought to analyse, for instance, the veritable Kula cycle shown in the exchange of visiting cards at the New Year among professors of medicine. [On the Kula cycle, 'where the armshells always go round in one direction and the necklaces in the other', see P. Bourdieu, *Reproduction*, tr. R. Nice, London, Sage, 1977, p. 112. (Tr.)]
- 33 Many law professors exercise functions as experts or consultants with public or private bodies, national (Ministry of Justice, for instance) or international (UNESCO), or as official delegates of government agencies (in international conferences, Common Market committees, the International Labour Organization, the United Nations, etc.). For example: 'I was the French government delegate to the conference at The Hague. . . . Now I am on a Common Market committee in Brussels every two months which is concerned with harmonizing all European legislation. Last year at the Ministry of Justice I was on a committee which was revising the statutes on nationality. Now I am still on the Brussels committee. For several years I was one of the experts on the committee of the International Labour Organization. . . . There are conferences. I am a member of the Institute of International Law' (a professor from the Paris law faculty).
- 34 Homais and Bournisien, characters in Flaubert's *Madame Bovary*, are a pretentious, positivistic pharmacist and a naïve, ignorant priest. [Tr.]
- 35 It is impossible to record all the consequences – most often prejudicial to the real progress of research – of the universalization of the model of the natural sciences under the combined influences of the organizational and technological models of these sciences and the bureaucratic logic which have led a body of research administrators, disposed by their training and their specific interests to a strictly technocratic vision, to know and acknowledge only 'projects' designed on the model of the natural sciences; thus it is that we have seen the accumulation of a whole series of vast, big-budget enterprises, using 'the latest technology' and

- substantial contingents of the 'unskilled workmen' of research, dedicated to the fragmentary tasks which alone can be engendered by the programmes arising from the alliance of technocrats totally ignorant of the sciences they claim to administer or even direct, with researchers dispossessed enough to allow themselves to have the objects and objectives of their study imposed by a 'social need' elaborated in confused 'think-tank' sessions of committees, commissions and other assemblies of scientifically irresponsible 'scientific authorities'.
- 36 The same is true of professors of law, and, in many cases, of arts professors. Professors of law especially often identify research with *personal* work, linked to their teaching: 'I have no official functions as regards research, so the question is irrelevant. . . . The research one can carry out in present conditions remains a purely individual research which one does for oneself and at one's own expense. . . . I cannot dissociate teaching from research. All pedagogical activity implies research and all research leads inevitably sooner or later to pedagogical activity. . . . Everything we do, in very difficult circumstances, is immediately absorbed pedagogically and we are absolutely unable to distance ourselves enough to make any long-term preparation for research' (professor of public law, Paris).
- 37 This is true for all the faculties, the effect of contamination which academic power exercises over the representation of scientific authority being no doubt the greater, the less autonomous and formalized is the academic competence.
- 38 Nettelbeck, *Le Recrutement des professeurs d'université*, p. 44.
- 39 In the case of law, the candidates for the *agrégation* competitive examination are recruited from an intimate group of doctoral students, part-time assistants and assistant lecturers, that is to say from the people who have been able to make themselves known (cf. Nettelbeck, *Le Recrutement des professeurs d'université*, p. 25). In the case of medicine, the protection of a 'head' was an absolute condition of success – which meant that the competitive examination itself was often a pure fiction. This was the case in the *agrégation*, for instance, according to one of the professors questioned: 'Between you and me, it was a competitive examination for which we had absolutely no respect. We treated it as a free supplement, because you just had to know the examiners. So you only entered for it if your "head" was on the board of examiners. Between an *agrégé* and a hospital surgeon without the *agrégation*, there was no difference. . . . The *agrégation* wasn't a diploma, or, rather, it was a diploma, but there was no problem obtaining it' (a professor at the Paris medical faculty).
- 40 For *illusio*, see P. Bourdieu, *Outline of a Theory of Practice*, tr. R. Nice, Cambridge, 1978. [Tr.]

- 41 'Oh, there are doctors in my family on all sides. We really are a great medical family. My father was a doctor; of my four uncles, three were doctors. Of my eight cousins, there are at least four or five who are doctors, I haven't counted. My brother isn't a doctor, but he's a dentist, he's a professor at the Paris dental school. Truly, when we have a family reunion, *it's like a faculty committee*' (a professor at the Paris medical faculty).
- 42 J. Rivero, 'La Formation et le recrutement des professeurs des facultés de droit françaises', *Doctrina, Revista de derecho, jurisprudencia y administración* (Uruguay), 59, 1962, pp. 249–61. Jean Rivero was tenured professor of administrative law and director of the lecture course for the *agrégation* in public law at the Paris law faculty.
- 43 *Internes* are 'resident hospital doctors' and *externes* are 'junior hospital doctors'. Both posts were available to students who had completed their theoretical medical studies. Since the *interne* competition creamed off the best students, the *externe* posts were considered second best. [Tr.]
- 44 It has often been noted how important rhetoric, or even eloquence, is in the competitive examination for resident hospital doctors (cf. J. Hamburger, *Conseil aux étudiants en médecine de mon service*, Paris, Flammarion, 1963, pp. 9–10).
- 45 Everything leads us to suppose that this relation between the degree of objectification of the specific capital necessary for the production and the commercialization of the products and the differential chances of the new entrants, therefore of the entrance hurdles, can be seen in all the fields, starting with the economic field properly speaking. (Thus it is no coincidence that, within the field of cultural production, it is in the theatre sector, and especially that of the bourgeois theatre, that the greatest professional heredity could be found throughout the nineteenth century.)
- 46 We cannot entirely account for the opposition between a science subject and an arts subject without seeing that scientific practices are involved in the specifically social process of objectification and institutionalization: I refer, of course, to the role of writing as instrumental in the break with the mimetic immediacy of thought expressed orally, or to the role of all the formal symbolisms, especially logical or mathematical, which bring to their fruition the effects of objectification through writing, by substituting for intuition, even if geometrical, the autonomous logic of symbolism and its own evidence, 'the blind evidence' in the words of Leibniz, which arises from the symbols themselves (Leibniz also called it *evidentia ex terminis*). It is clear that such progress in objectification of methods of thought is always accomplished in and through the social forms which it presupposes and which it brings to fruition (dialectics, from which logic derives, being for instance indissociable from institutionalized

- discussion, a kind of tournament between two adversaries in the presence of the public); and we could distinguish between subjects according to the degree of rationalization and formalization of the forms of communication which they employ.
- 47 We could use the same model to describe the relations between law and economics as established at the end of a progress towards self-sufficiency which released economics from the status of a series of ancillary disciplines (cf. L. Le Van-Lemesle, 'L'Economie politique à la conquête d'une légitimité (1896-1937)', *Actes de la recherche en sciences sociales*, 1983, 47-8, pp. 113-17).
- 48 This opposition is perfectly homologous to that established, in another field, between the engineer and the architect: in this case, the arts man can invoke the unavoidable exigencies of art (and secondarily of the art of living, that is to say of 'Man') to counter the inhuman and unaesthetic constraints of technique.
- 49 We hardly need hint at the specifically scientific repercussions of the hierarchy which arose between chairs, and which destined certain research chairs (such as the chair of bacteriology) to be merely holding positions for aspirants to a more prestigious clinical chair (for all these points, see the fine study by H. Jamous, *Contribution à une sociologie de la décision: la réforme des études médicales et les études hospitalières*, Paris, CES, 1967).
- 50 Cf. I. Kant, *Le Conflit des facultés*, Paris, Vrin, 1953, pp. 14-15, 28 and 37. The partial validity of the Kantian description leads us to ask what are the invariants in the university field, and suggests the need for a systematic comparison of the different national traditions in different periods.
- 51 Quoted by M. Foucault, *Naissance de la clinique: une archéologie du regard médical*, Paris, Presses Universitaires de France, 1963.
- 52 It is no coincidence that the law faculty has been so slow to renounce the external signs of statutory authority, the ermine and the gown being the indispensable instruments of the *work of representation* and display of authority of the texts and their interpreters which is an integral part of the very exercise of their function, that is, the act of producing law.
- 53 An important part of so-called theoretical work in philosophy, literature or law consists in trying to ground in reason notions in '-ism' (Marxism, naturalism or liberalism) which, as we shall see below for structuralism, are principally, if not exclusively, founded in social necessity.
- 54 We can see that the particular nature of its object, which it has in common, in its phenomenal definition, with the juridical subjects, places sociology in a quite special position: if it does happen that the opinion of scholars becomes an orthodoxy here, it is more often fated to be greatly dispersed because of the absence of strict academic and especially

- social control over entrants to the profession and the correlative diversity of the social and academic origins of those producing the opinion.
- 55 In the university committee of support for the candidature of Valéry Giscard d'Estaing [when Giscard was standing for election as President of the Republic (Tr.)] (*Le Quotidien de Paris*, 17 May 1974), the professors of medicine, and of law and economics, were very strongly represented, especially in Paris: that is, respectively 28 and 18 out of 64 (as opposed to 10 from the arts and none from science) in Paris, and 18 and 14 out of 47 (opposed to 8 from the arts and 7 from science) in the provinces (in Paris, there were in addition five members of the Institute and one professor from the CNAM). The different lists of support for François Mitterrand do not allow so precise an estimate because of the fact that the titles, when they are given, are too vague. But the arts and science faculties were strongly represented.
- 56 When we consider public attitudes as more 'true' - or 'sincere' - than private opinions, such as those confided to friends, we forget how much these public demonstrations can be automatic, even *obligatory* - without necessarily being less 'sincere' - as when, for instance, they are part of a role being played, or a social identity being defended, etc. We might, in this perspective, analyse the influence that the general opinion concerning the 'true' opinion of an agent - 'X is left-wing' - can exercise, in different circumstances, on public expressions of opinion, since these may be motivated by the intention of confirming or denying this opinion.
- 57 The error of perception which makes professors from the arts faculties appear predominantly left-wing allows professors from these faculties who declare themselves publicly to be right-wing - and these are relatively rare, or at least were so before 1968 - to seem to themselves as well as to others rather heroic heretics, whereas, as we saw in May 1968, and if we except the general disapproval caused by any public expression of opinion or by journalistic compromise, they have the support of the great majority of their colleagues.
- 58 Trade-union membership in France is generally lower than in the UK. Moreover, there is often a choice of two or three different unions in each profession, the difference being defined by wider political sympathies. The SNESup (Syndicat National de l'Enseignement Supérieur) is the union for lecturers and professors of the 'traditional' left, tending to sympathize with the communist party, the SGEN (Syndicat Général de l'Enseignement National) is the more radical-left alternative. Thus membership of the SNESup or the SGEN suggests varying degrees of overt left-wing sympathies, and membership of the Syndicat Autonome ('non-aligned union') may be seen as an overtly right-wing stance. [Tr.]
- 59 The AEERS (Association d'Etude pour l'Expansion de la Recherche Scientifique) is a study group for the expansion of scientific research. [Tr.]

- 60 An opposition of the same kind can be observed, at the heart of the arts faculty, between sociology and the canonical subjects which it may take as its object (as in the sociology of education) or whose object it may take (as in the sociology of art, literature or philosophy).
- 61 This note was drafted with the help of Marie-Ange Schiltz. For further details, see J.-P. Benzécri et al., *L'Analyse des données*, vol. 2: *L'Analyse des correspondances*, Paris, Dunod, 1973; P. Cibois, *L'Analyse factorielle*, Que Sais-Je?, no. 2095, Paris, Presses Universitaires de France, 1984; L. Lebart, A. Morineau and K. Warwick, *Multivariate Descriptive Statistical Analysis: Correspondence Analysis and Related Techniques for Large Matrices*, New York, Wiley, 1984. [The note, which has been written especially for the English edition of *Homo Academicus*, explains the method used to construct the three-dimensional model developed from Bourdieu's data. Different planes of this diagram are shown on pages 50, 80, 82 and 276 of the present edition. [Tr.]]

Chapter 3 Types of Capital and Forms of Power

- 1 No doubt all the greater, because of the expansion of the teaching body, for absorbing a large number of writers, journalist-writers and writer-journalists.
- 2 The faculties which, on a surface level, can be treated as homogeneous ensembles in terms of their objective relations as rivals can also, without contradiction, appear at another level of analysis as fields which are themselves subject to differences of different kinds.
- 3 We decided not to select direction of a laboratory as one of the properties determining belonging: it is in fact very difficult to distinguish the cases where this title is a statutory attribute of the professor, as often in the faculties or even, in more than one case, at the Ecole des Hautes Etudes, and the cases where it implies the effective direction of a real research team; so that we cannot treat it as an index of university power, nor as an index of scientificity or of being engaged in research.
- 4 Because of the fact that information available tends to diminish as renown diminishes, this selection procedure also has the practical advantage of facilitating research by limiting the proportion studied to the fraction of the base population most represented in the written sources. But we see what can be gained in rigour by limiting this population through explicit and specific (that is, pertinent) criteria, instead of allowing the limits of the population studied to be imposed by the limits of available documentation, as do for example all those who rely on sources like *Who's Who* (thus the proportion of professors studied who are mentioned in *Who's Who* is unequally linked to the different kinds of academic power – partly because mention in *Who's Who* is rejected by some of the most prestigious researchers, because it indicates 'society' consecration).

- 5 The journalist-professors are distinguished from journalists, and in particular from cultural journalists, who have an effect on the university field, by the fact that they can use *within* the university field itself the power that access to journalism gives them, with all its correlative profits. (Thus, to be strictly logical, we should have chosen this criterion, whose importance continues to increase, if only to enable us to account for certain university careers, especially at the 6th section of the Ecole des Hautes Etudes, and to account for the development of this institution as a whole.)
- 6 The enquiry underestimates specifically academic power because of the fact that, in more than one case, we were unable to take into account the *intensity* of the power associated with the possession of the attribute treated as indicator (for example, the status of president of a committee of the CNRS or the CCU, etc.) or the *duration* of the possession of this power: positions held in the same place, those of the great university heads who have dominated a whole discipline for many years, are no doubt less clearly distinguished in the analysis than in reality. On the other hand, we have not always been able to obtain, for the whole population, the most obviously pertinent information, such as the number of theses directed and the social status of the doctoral students (although we were able to verify, for some disciplines, that these indicators co-vary with indices of academic power). Finally, the introduction of supplementary principles of verification was inhibited by the fact that each one (for instance, the opposition between those published by Les Belles Lettres and those published by Klincksieck) concerned only a tiny sector of the field.
- 7 Among the factors of uncertainty, as much over whom to include in the population studied as over how to determine the position held within the field, one of the most important is the unequal wealth of information possessed depending on the quality of the sources: those who are known from seven or eight different sources are likely, other things being equal, to seem endowed with more properties than those who are only known from *Who's Who* and complementary sources of a lesser quality. Another factor is the often deliberate imprecision over the father's profession: this uncertainty particularly affects the categories of executives and traders (we had to abandon distinctions between middle and senior management and between small shopkeepers and larger traders) and even the category of teachers (the break is often unclear between teachers in secondary and teachers in higher education).
- 8 Whatever we may say of the effects of fashion, academic or intellectual prestige is much more stable than academic power, which is more closely linked with the *position* and less to its holder. (We know, however – and it is one of the most revealing characteristics of this field which claims to recognize only scientific values – that there is no such thing, or hardly any such thing, as a genuine institutional criterion of scientific value.)

- 9 As far as the collection of information is concerned, we resorted to the same procedures and the same sources as in the case of the representative sample of the professors of the four faculties. With this difference, that we did not select participation in the conferences of Caen and Amiens and the religion of the family of origin, because of the fact that the positions marked enabled us to characterize only an insignificant fraction of the population; and, on the other hand, we added all the information on careers and positions of internal power which, on this scale, took on their full significance.
- 10 A similar analysis of the academic and non-academic factors of success for the whole set of the faculties encounters several obstacles: first, the indices of academic capital are not at all comparable (qualifications like the *agrégation* or the doctorate having very different values in the different faculties), and there exists no universal standard which would have the same role as the title of *normalien* does in the arts and science faculties; second, the differentiation of powers is not everywhere as clear as in the arts and does not operate everywhere according to the same principles. It remains the case, as we have seen, that geographical and social origins seem closely linked in all of the faculties to differences in success which can be perceived through the application of common criteria (external renown, scientific consecration, etc.)
- 11 We could no doubt link this opposition, inherent both in institutions and in personal dispositions, to the distinction established by Elga Reuter and Pierre Tripiet between two forms of scientific production: on the one hand the 'minimizers', who aim to minimize the risks by producing works conforming in their objects and methods to the prevailing norms (such as the state doctorate) and, on the other hand, the 'professionals', who are usually attached to research institutions, and produce short works, making a swift scientific contribution (cf. E. Reuter et P. Tripiet, 'Travail et créativité dans un marché interne: le cas du système français de recherche universitaire', *Sociologie du travail*, July-September 1980, pp. 241-56).
- 12 It is remarkable that the structure of relations described here is maintained as such, despite all the distortions, when one neutralizes - treating them as illustrative variables - the institutions belonged to, Collège de France, Sorbonne, EPHE 4th and 5th sections, 6th section, Nanterre.
- 13 See *Lire*, 68, April 1981, pp. 38-51.
- 14 The almost total exclusion of the non-university world, which is often affirmed as an elective refusal to compromise with society, is doubtless only a way of assuming an exclusion more or less cruelly felt in proportion to the increasing importance of journalism in intellectual life. Apart from evidence from holders of journalistic power (cf. the declaration by Mona Ozouf in C. Sales, 'L'intelligentsia, visite aux artisans de la culture', *Le Monde de l'éducation*, February 1976, p. 8).

- we can invoke admissions such as this one by a Paris professor of philosophy, who, after declaring that one should 'keep a great distance between journalism and philosophical research', deplored the fact that, despite all his efforts, he had never managed to have an article published in *Le Monde*.
- 15 'One element of power is supervision of the theses which lead to appointment as lecturer and assistant lecturer. It is an essential means of action' (historian, 1971 - we have not been able, in this as in other cases, to give indications situating our informants more precisely in the space of the positions, without running the risk of betraying their anonymity).
- 16 The metaphor of 'social weight' perfectly expresses the logic of the field, the very logic that the analysis of correspondences allows to be reconstituted through a mathematical operation analogous to that which consists in seeking the axes of inertia of a system of weighted points.
- 17 The concentration in Paris of all the important state doctoral theses (that is, eleven theses in modern history that had obtained a 'very honourable' mention [*summum cum laude* (USA), or first class (UK)] between November 1939 and December 1948 inclusive - according to J.-B. Duroselle) gives total control over the recruitment of tenured staff.
- 18 To these positions, Pierre Renouvin finally added those of dean of the faculty of arts in Paris, and president of the Fondation Nationale des Sciences Politiques (cf. the obituary notice on Pierre Renouvin by J.-B. Duroselle, in *Revue d'histoire moderne et contemporaine*, 22, October-December 1975, pp. 497-507).
- 19 This is why, as I shall show, the crisis in relations between the old and the new entrants arises from a break in the harmony which used to obtain, for the great majority of new entrants, between the personally internalized structures of expectation (waiting) and the objective structures (likely trajectories), a break which is influenced simultaneously by the effects of a transformation of the structure of probabilities of promotion and of a modification in the dispositions of the agents. In such a conjuncture, the 'old' and the 'young' feel 'out of phase', the former seeing careerist ambition in what is experienced as a normal claim, and the latter seeing mandarinal conservatism in what is felt to be an appeal for ethical standards.
- 20 The LAFMA (Liste d'Aptitude à la Fonction de Maître-Assistant) is the waiting-list for *assistants* (assistant lecturers) nominated for promotion to posts of *maître-assistant* (lecturer). Vacant lectureships are filled from this list in order. During the period studied by Bourdieu there was a bottleneck, with more qualified candidates than vacancies. [Tr.]
- 21 While less institutionalized than bureaucratic power as it is exercised in public or private enterprise, power over the agencies of reproduction of the university body is much more institutionalized than the power of

consecration which is current in the field of cultural production. It is much less institutionalized, however, in the arts faculties than in the medical faculties, where the heads have at their disposal a whole series of institutionalized instruments of control, such as all the successive competitive examinations (junior hospital doctor, resident hospital doctor, assistant, *agrégation*, etc.).

- 22 Cf. T. Caplow and R. J. McGee, *The Academic Marketplace*, New York, Doubleday, 1965 (1st edn, 1958), p. 99.
- 23 The same logic can be seen at work in the private studios which in the nineteenth century prepared painters for the Prix de Rome. Everything was done to keep the pupils up to an advanced age in a state of absolute subordination to the master (there was, for example, a whole series of stages through which they had to pass – drawing from engraving, then from plaster casts, then from live models, painting, etc., at a speed determined by the master). Quite old people could be held back at the drawing stage. Nobody could tell how long they might have to spend at any particular stage. In a studio like that of Delaroche, famous for its success in the competition, only the most hardy could survive the discouragement induced by the manoeuvres and intrigues (cf. A. Boime, *The Academy and French Painting in the Nineteenth Century*, London, Phaidon, 1971, and J. Lethève, *La Vie quotidienne des artistes français au XIXe siècle*, Paris, Hachette, 1968).
- 24 *Chargés d'enseignement* hold posts at the appropriate level of professor or senior lecturer, created where no titular post of professor was available. [Tr.]
- 25 Cf. Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ch. 10, 'Power'. [Tr.]
- 26 These calculations are based on the *Liste des thèses d'histoire contemporaine déposées dans les facultés de lettres de France métropolitaine, arrêtée au 1er octobre 1966* (N = 756, of which 347 state doctoral theses, 60 'complementary' theses, 271 'third cycle' theses and 78 'university' theses), a list drawn up at the request of the Association of Contemporary History Professors of the French History Faculties. A description of this document may be found in J.-B. Duroselle, 'Les thèses d'histoire contemporaine. Aires cultivées et zones en friche', *Revue d'histoire moderne et contemporaine*, January–March 1967, pp. 71–7.
- 27 This hierarchy, which is hardly different if we add 'complementary' theses, is modified quite profoundly if we take into consideration the ensemble of theses supervised, including 'third-cycle' theses (and *a fortiori* if we consider only these theses). Although Girard, Duroselle, Mollat and Perroy are still in the top ten and still in the same order, we note the entry of Rémond and Reinhardt and afterwards a whole group of professors from the Ecole des Sciences Politiques and the Ecole des Hautes Etudes. This gap is even more evident if we consider the

- supervision of 'third-cycle' theses alone: Rémond (Nanterre, Sciences Po.), 44; Vilar (Sorbonne, EPHE), 20; Reinhardt (Sorbonne, Sciences Po.) 18; Chesnaux (EPHE), 14; Gagniacé (Sorbonne) and Grosser (Science Po.), 14; Lavau (Sciences Po.), 12; Hurtig (Sciences Po.), Lhuillier (Strasbourg), Touchard (Sciences Po.), 10 (the significance of these totals is limited by the fact that some professors – here, those of Sciences Po. – may also supervise theses registered in other disciplines, and therefore not counted).
- 28 At the time of the enquiry, lecturers and professors were expected to research for a *doctorat d'Etat* (state doctorate), which involved completing a vast principal thesis, as well as a smaller, complementary thesis, after a decade or even more of research. The *doctorat de troisième cycle* (third-cycle doctorate) was introduced in the late 1950s to provide a quicker type of research training for students, involving a short thesis to be written within about three years, before appointment to a teaching post. As Bourdieu's analysis shows, the philosophies behind the two doctorates were divergent. Since the French edition of *Homo Academicus* was published, the French government has decided to reform the system by phasing out the two existing doctorates and replacing them with a single *nouveau doctorat*. For the moment (1988) there are thus temporarily *three* doctorates in operation. [Tr.]
- 29 These calculations are based on a list, classified according to supervisors of theses (completed and passed) which were noted in an enquiry into researchers by the Maison des Sciences de l'Homme: the totals therefore underestimate the proportion of theses supervised, in comparison with the *Liste des travaux en grec, en latin* (Association des Professeurs de Langues Anciennes de l'Enseignement Supérieure, June 1971), all the more since not all the researchers or professors in a particular discipline answered the enquiry; but they do give a more accurate gauge than the lists of theses registered between any two relatively close dates, both of the number of theses supervised overall by each professor and of the social capital that they represent, since they note those theses intended to be realistically operative in the French academic market.
- 30 This list, which is based on the enquiry of the Maison des Sciences de l'Homme in 1967, calls for the same remarks as the list of theses in Greek studies. It is certain, in particular, that it underestimates the overall number of candidates: for instance, Henri Gouhier declares in an interview that he had a permanent number of 50–80 postgraduate students and that he participated in about fifteen vivas every year; another, less popular, professor says that, at the time of the enquiry, he had between 25 and 30 postgraduate students, whether candidates for the 'state' doctorate or for the 'third-cycle' doctorate, and that he participated in five or six vivas. The census of theses registered at the

Sorbonne for the years 1965 to 1968 inclusive (*Répertoire raisonné des sujets en cours des doctorats d'Etat - lettres et sciences humaines - inscrits en France, 1965-1970*, University of Paris X-Nanterre and Centre de Documentation Sciences Humaines) leads to a slightly different list, which is understandable, since it provides a better picture of the attraction of the different heads over a limited period of time than of the capital in clientele that they have accumulated in the course of their careers (thus Hyppolite, who entered the Collège de France in 1961 regresses, whereas Souriau and Wahl, who retired, disappear). A rigorous analysis would have to distinguish between academic generations - which do not coincide with biological generations and which mean that professors of the same biological age but who were appointed to the Sorbonne at different ages may be quite non-comparable as regards the number and status of their clientele; and also because the most powerful are often those who, having reached positions of power when they were young, have been in power longest.

- 31 Using the list of theses in philosophy already cited (theses registered and classified according to topic studied), we redistributed the theses between the different supervisors and attributed to each thesis the known characteristics of its author (as taken from the enquiry of the Maison des Sciences de l'Homme on researchers).
- 32 The comparison between the candidates of Ernest Labrousse, Director of Studies at the Ecole des Hautes Etudes as well as professor at the Sorbonne (or even Pierre Vilar, also a member of both institutions), and those of Louis Girard, professor at the Sorbonne, who was for a long time president of the CCU, shows us that things are different when the canonical university (as is the case in history) no longer has the monopoly of possible careers, because of the opportunities offered by other institutions such as the Ecole des Hautes Etudes or Sciences Po. While the pupils of Louis Girard have mostly had obscure careers or have made a name for themselves outside the university, like Louis Mermaz [socialist politician], Jean Ellenstein [ex-communist and historian] or Louis Mexandeau [socialist politician], a number of Ernest Labrousse's pupils have become some of the most prestigious historians of their generation and a large proportion of them have followed a career in the Ecole des Hautes Etudes (or at Vincennes).
- 33 We can understand in this light the obligatory elegy by the successor in honour of his predecessor, and its contents, inextricably mingling declarations of gratitude to the 'head' with professions of intellectual recognition of the 'master'.
- 34 It goes without saying that social necessity can only operate by disguising itself beneath a veneer of technical necessity. So the double bind linking the two necessities tends to become the rule, with the connivance of both parties, and constitutes one of the major obstacles to the institution

of genuine contracts of *apprenticeship* freely consented to, in which the constraints and controls imposed aim to prepare for their own disappearance, by providing the instruments of labour which are the condition of genuine intellectual liberty.

- 35 We shall see that power in an institution of cultural production or reproduction implies a specifically cultural form of authority, a sort of *institutional charisma*.
- 36 Cf. J. Heurgon, obituary notice of Marcel Durry, *Bulletin de l'association Guillaume Budé*, 1, 1978, pp. 1-3, and P. Grimal, *Revue d'études latines*, 55, 1977, pp. 28-32.
- 37 F. Robert, *Bulletin de l'association Guillaume Budé*, 1, March 1980, pp. 1-4, and P. Grimal, *Revue d'études latines*, 5, 1979, pp. 29-31.
- 38 In this perspective, it is impossible to overestimate the importance of the *syllabuses* which play a determining role in the conditioning of the clientele - students and future masters - by defining the world of *academically profitable* bodies of knowledge and by thus contributing to produce and reproduce *syllabuses of thought*.
- 39 In the phrase 'les miraculés du mérite' Bourdieu links the idea of a meritocratic elite with the idea of privileged escape from otherwise certain social disaster. *Un miraculé* is commonly a miraculously lucky survivor of some normally fatal accident. [Tr.]
- 40 L. Spitzer, *Etudes de style*, preface by J. Starobinski, Paris, Gallimard, 1970, p. 165, n. 26, and p. 159, no. 2.
- 41 Candidates for entrance to a *grande école* spend as much as two years after the *baccalauréat* cramming for the *grandes écoles* entrance examination in a *classe préparatoire*, which is to be found only at a few of the most prestigious *lycées*. The arts class is a *khagne*, the science class a *taupe*. [Tr.]
- 42 This is no doubt even truer in the faculties of law or medicine, where an air of reliability, as an index of support for the values of bourgeois normality, is all the more strongly required since the opposition between brilliance and respectability is not pertinent, and since the most brilliant are also the most reliable, showing most clearly and quickly their support for the traditions of the community (this precocious reliability does not, however, exclude controlled and statutory debauch, that is, ritually limited in social time and space, quite the contrary).
- 43 E. Haugen, *Language Conflict and Language Planning*, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 1966, p. 4.
- 44 'Que Sais-Je?' is a Penguin-type paperback series providing introductory guides to, or surveys of, different areas of knowledge, over the whole range of the arts and sciences. [Tr.]
- 45 We know the links existing between the Presses Universitaires de France and professors at the Sorbonne, *ex officio* general editors of the major series, which publish subsidized theses and works of synthesis socially

- approved by institutional authority. (We ought to analyse in terms of the same logic the functions and the ambiguous role of the university presses (Ateliers d'Imprimerie Universitaire).)
- 46 At the other pole of the field, the hit-parade effect operates through the medium of the papers and above all the cultural weeklies, which allow direct access, in certain conjunctures, to the student public.
- 47 It would have been interesting to measure the intensity of orientation towards teaching by counting the number of 'extra' teaching hours in the 'home' institution or elsewhere: all the indications are that, the nearer we move towards the pole of the 'reproducers', the more frequently we encounter those able to garner considerable economic profit by an often very economic proliferation, intellectually speaking, of lectures on the same entrance examination syllabus, especially for the *agrégation*, at the Sorbonne, at the Ecole Normale Supérieure, at the Ecole Sévigne, etc.
- 48 On the power bases in the faculties of medicine, see especially H. Jamous, *Contribution à une sociologie de la décision*, Paris, CES, 1967, pp. 108-11.
- 49 This medieval Latin term for lecturers (literally 'readers') indicates their role as unquestioning broadcasters of received dogma. [Tr.]
- 50 The proportion of 'eminent academics' has, it seems, increased since 1968 as a result of the reconciliation, provoked by the crisis, between great scholars and grand orators, until then strongly opposed.
- 51 Given the extreme closure of the canonical university to everything alien to it, the marginal institutions, and especially the Ecole des Hautes Etudes, have been the refuge for German émigrés between the wars and émigrés from eastern Europe after 1945.
- 52 We could also invoke the case of Georges Dumézil, whose career developed to a considerable extent abroad and entirely outside the canonical university.
- 53 If we find religious specialists (for instance Festugière, a historian of Greek religion) among the most eminent specialists, it is no doubt because their academic vocation is linked to the ethico-religious dispositions of minorities who had to justify their place within the lay university through the excellence of their research (the presence of 'survivors' originating in the subordinate classes should perhaps be understood in terms of the same logic); as for left-wing Roman Catholics, like Marrou, their presence in academically advanced positions is explained by the fact that they have had to assert themselves both against the dominant lay tradition and against the majority Roman Catholic position which is to be found towards the pole of belles-lettres (Heurgon, Courcelles, etc.) and towards the pole of the 'humanist' reaction against the republican tradition (Roman Catholic censorship here taking the form of a literary censorship appealing to etiquette and elegance).

- 54 The more we move towards the pole of research, the more we see an increase in the likelihood of a gap between specifically symbolic capital and academic status, some of the most prestigious intellectuals holding quite minor university posts (as, at the time of the enquiry, Louis Althusser, Roland Barthes or Michel Foucault).
- 55 Director, Fernand Braudel. [Tr.]
- 56 Director, Claude Lévi-Strauss. [Tr.]
- 57 Director, Fernand Braudel. [Tr.]
- 58 Director, Jean-Pierre Vernant. [Tr.]
- 59 If the principal originality of the Ecole des Hautes Etudes, that is, the decisive contribution which it has brought to the development of genuine research in the social sciences, is minimized, it is also because the enquiry grasps it at a moment when its most successful investments have already brought in substantial profits, but which are often attributed to other institutions (notably the Collège de France).
- 60 Relations with foreign countries, and especially the United States, are one of the most powerful principles of differentiation between agents, disciplines and institutions, and by the same token one of the most contentious stakes of the symbolic struggles for recognition. The 6th section of the Ecole des Hautes Etudes is one of the high spots of academic 'internationalism'; it has been the centre of importation of a number of academic novelties and also one of the most important centres of exportation abroad (especially in the domain of history and semiology).
- 61 The Ecole des Hautes Etudes in social science has thus become the focus of exchanges between the university field and the field of journalism. Those, like François Furet, who possess both power over a university institution, that is over posts and careers, and power over the press and publishing, are able to accumulate and exercise a considerable symbolic power through a circuit of very complex exchanges between goods which are current in the academic field, such as posts, promotion, and the services current in the journalistic field, such as book reviews and celebratory articles.
- 62 R. Picard, *Nouvelle critique ou nouvelle imposture*, Paris, Pauvert, 1965, p. 84; and *Le Monde*, 14 and 28 March, 4 and 11 April 1964.
- 63 J. Piatier, 'La "nouvelle critique" est-elle une imposture?', *Le Monde*, 23 October 1965.
- 64 J. Bloch-Michel, 'Barthes-Picard: troisième round', *Le Nouvel Observateur*, 30 March-5 April 1966.
- 65 R. Barthes, *Critique et vérité*, Paris, Seuil, 1966, p. 53.
- 66 *Tel Quel* is an intellectual review combining literary structuralism with ultra-left politics. [Tr.]
- 67 *Le Monde*, 5 February 1966. Others add Mauron or Rousset.
- 68 A list of articles in favour of Raymond Picard may be found in Barthes, *Critique et vérité*, p. 10, n. 1.

- 69 R. Matignon, 'Le Maintien de l'ordre', *L'Express*, 2-8 May 1986.
- 70 Picard, *Nouvelle critique ou nouvelle imposture*, p. 69.
- 71 Ibid., p. 72.
- 72 Ibid., pp. 78-9.
- 73 R. Picard, 'Un nihilisme confortable', *Le Nouvel Observateur*, 13-19 April 1964.
- 74 E. Guitton, *Le Monde*, 13 November 1965.
- 75 Barthes, *Critique et vérité*, p. 13.
- 76 Ibid., p. 14.
- 77 'How can we deny Pascal, Racine and Mallarmé the insight which might be granted them by social science, psychoanalysis, Marxism and sociology? How, in the days of abstract painting and quantum physics, can we leave criticism with only those tools which it had at its disposal in the days of Galileo and Philippe de Champaigne?' (R. Matignon, *L'Express*, 2-8 May 1966).
- 78 'When we read Raymond Picard, we sometimes feel as if we are sitting an examination for the *baccalauréat*' (J. Duvignaud, *Le Nouvel Observateur*, 3-9 November 1965).
- 79 Cf. C. Charle, *La Crise littéraire à l'époque du naturalisme*, Paris, Pens, 1970, pp. 157ff, and A. Compagnon, *La Troisième République des lettres*, Paris, 1983.
- 80 'L'homme et l'œuvre' ('The man and his work') are series of literary monographs providing students' guides to major authors, based on a traditional biographical and descriptive approach. [Tr.]
- 81 The opposition between the modernist defenders of scientific culture who find allies among senior civil servants and scientific administrators, privileged purveyors of technocratic modernism and holders of a new power, different both from the power of production and the power of reproduction, and the traditionalist defenders of literary culture, must not disguise the emergence of a third pole, that of economico-political culture, whose importance tends to grow in proportion to its increase in symbolic efficiency in the political field. (Analysis of replies to the national enquiry of the AEERS on the university shows that the pure technocratic position, which would subordinate all the functioning of the academic system to imperatives of productivity, is practically not represented in the professorial body, but that there is a substantial contingent of professors, especially in the science faculties, who agree with the top state executives in hoping for a kind of scientific rationalization. Their concern to see scarce scientific resources increased and concentrated coincides with the technocrats' desire to rationalize the use of scientific resources.)
- 82 This student public has no doubt played a decisive role, right through the nineteenth century, in the progress of the intellectual and artistic field towards autonomy (in relation to the academic authorities in

- particular) by providing 'avant-garde' production with what only 'bourgeois art' enjoyed, that is a public large enough to justify the development and the functioning of specific instances of production and diffusion (which is clear enough in the case of avant-garde cinema) and thereby contributing to making the intellectual field close in on itself. It remains true that the same recourse to a public outside the field can serve just as easily to form the basis of real innovations as to legitimize incompetence and conservatism (as, for example, in the resort to politicization, which has often been used, even in painting, as an excuse for incompetence or failure).
- 83 Cf. appendix 3.
- 84 The social sciences are also a refuge for some of the specialists of the 'hard' sciences, often inclined to pay compulsory homage to their original milieu, which still dominates them, by making a critical and pejorative representation of the social sciences, whose specific logic they often have difficulty mastering; and all the while using their specific capital to threaten social science with a sort of methodological censorship, which often enough lacks any grounding in the real logic of science.
- 85 Cf. chapter 4 below.
- 86 The appearance of this new market has transformed the distribution of opportunities among the professors themselves, especially in geography, and in sociology. This was noted by one observer, conscious that new criteria of appreciation and new capacities were henceforth at issue: 'There are more and more organizations: what counts is access to money, to travel subsidies, to work funded by the Ministry, by the District, by the Paris regional council, etc., and then it isn't necessarily the intellectual level which counts in attributing the money' (geographer, 1972).
- 87 For an ideal-typical expression of the *claim* for a new definition of the intellectual, see M. Crozier, 'La Révolution culturelle', *Daedalus*, December 1963.
- 88 The authoritative centre-left newspaper *Le Monde* is published in the evening, instead of in the morning with the other French daily papers. [Tr.]
- 89 It is certain that the rise of the ENA at the expense of the ENS has contributed considerably to this transformation of the dominant representation of the intellectual.
- 90 Among the imperceptible transformations which only statistics can reveal, one of the most important is the considerable growth in the number of salary-earning producers, which is linked to the development of radio, television and public and private research organizations, that is to the intellectual craftsman.
- 91 As regards sharing time between teaching and research, there is a very marked opposition between the two extreme poles represented by on the one hand the professors of the canonical disciplines of the arts

faculties (or, at a pinch, the professors of the preparatory classes for the *grandes écoles*) and on the other hand the professors and researchers in social science who can devote themselves more completely to research. The same kind of opposition can be found as regards the relation between training received and professional practice: the perfect continuity which characterizes the academic and professional career of professors of *khagne* and *taupe* and, almost to the same extent, those of professors of literature and language, is opposed to the more or less total discontinuity which is displayed (and sometimes deliberately underlined, in an effort to display their conversion and their rejection) in the case of the social science researchers (cf. below, chapter 4).

- 92 The differential dependency of the different species of academic capital on the academic market may also be very easily seen on the occasion of emigration to a foreign country: the loss in value which affects all academically guaranteed cultural capital seems to affect more strongly those kinds most directly linked to the specificities of a national academic institution, like literary history or law.
- 93 The effect of statutory monopoly is never so clearly seen as at the time of the individual crises which are occasioned by retirement: the end of the most tyrannical reign has often been marked by a sudden collapse in the exchange rate of these compulsory authors.
- 94 The relations between philosophy and social science obey the same logic, with the difference that a fraction of the 'philosophers' managed to escape the common destiny (as also, it is true, did a - minute - fraction of 'grammarians') at the cost of more or less bold reconversion strategies, tending among other things to 'found', to 'conceptualize' or to annex the social sciences - especially structuralism - and thus to save at least the appearance of their former ambition and dominance. The fate of those who have remained faithful to the old definition of their post is all the more difficult. The social sciences, and especially ethnology and sociology, which in the fifties appeared as soft options, somewhat despised by those who were able to follow the royal way of the *Ecole Normale* and the *agrégation*, may now appear to them as offering an intolerable threat to philosophy and, in any case, as capable of usurping the imperial position always claimed by this discipline.
- 95 [For example, A. Martinet. (Tr.)] Of the philologist whose name remains associated with the most ferocious resistance to the movement of May 1968 [Frédéric Deloffre], an informer says: 'He was a pure product of what used to be called the "grammatical" *agrégation*; his thesis was a thesis on lexicography or lexicology. . . . He is a person who . . . well, it was he who said it . . . he was very proud to have been the top student of his graduation year [at the *Ecole Normale*] and to pass his doctorate and he had deliberately chosen that kind of specialization. In

fact, grammar was for him less an object of study than a career objective. He has said it over and over again. Just as he boasted of not preparing his lectures' (classics, 1971).

- 96 We need to bear these analyses in mind in order to understand the desperate, and in a certain sense pathetic, reactions, when confronted with the movement of May 1968, of these major or minor holders of cultural shares which were suddenly devalued like tsarist bonds after the Soviet Revolution (cf. chapter 5).

Chapter 4 The Defence of the Corps and the Break in Equilibrium

- 1 Since we cannot reproduce here the analysis of the factors of the increase in schooling, we can but refer to P. Bourdieu, 'Classement, déclassé, reclassement', *Actes de recherche en sciences sociales*, 24, November 1978, pp. 2-22, and *Distinction*, tr. R. Nice, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 1984.
- 2 See appendix 2 for the data on the morphological transformations of the student population; of the professorial body (by rank), the staff/student ratio and the inter-rank ratio (rank A/rank B) in the various faculties between 1949 and 1969.
- 3 If, in the case of the analysis of the long-term fluctuations in the overall value of academic diplomas, we have chosen to study the social destiny of *normaliens* from two different matriculation years, it is because the title of graduate of the *Ecole Normale Supérieure* (as opposed to the various *agrégations* and *a fortiori* the various bachelor's degrees) doubtless provides the academic qualification whose value is most constant in the various markets where it is negotiable, that is in the various academic sub-markets and even in the external markets (although to a lesser degree, because of the devaluation incurred by competition from the ENA).
- 4 In the arts faculties, the number of professors or the number of doctorates varies very little between 1949 and 1969, while the number of lecturers and assistant lecturers increases very rapidly, especially after 1959. Moreover, the number of third-cycle theses increases at a very fast rate, although the *agrégation* continues to hold a central place.
- 5 The analyses which follow are based on statistical data taken from the enquiry (already used above) which was carried out in 1967-8 by the *Maison des Sciences de l'Homme*. Initially conceived for the preparation of an Annual Directory, this enquiry had been designed from the start in such a way as to be an object of scientific enquiry, and M. Jean Viet, director of the project, gave us the opportunity to help draw up the questionnaire and insert a set of detailed questions on social origins.

Although it attracted a very high rate of reply (reaching around 80 per cent overall, and varying between 86 per cent in history and 67 per cent in literary studies), this enquiry suffers from the defects inherent in any enquiry by correspondence. If we know, as we have been able to verify elsewhere, that the propensity to reply varies as a function of the degree of identification, that the authorities had set themselves as prime objective an exhaustive census of the researchers and teachers at the top of the hierarchy, and finally that the identification of the teachers of rank B is both more difficult and less reliable, we can understand that the teachers of rank B are slightly underrepresented in all disciplines, as is revealed by a systematic comparison of the structures of the population sampled and the structures of the whole population of teachers in higher education. According to the same logic, people from the provinces and women appear somewhat underrepresented in relation to Parisians and men.

- 6 Thus sociology, which only found a place in the arts faculties in the framework of a degree certificate in philosophy (certificate in ethics and sociology) and whose teaching body was distinguished from that of philosophy neither by its mode of recruitment nor by the style of its research, becomes independent in 1958, with the creation of a degree in sociology, at the very moment when the largest cohorts of students enter the faculties.
- 7 See appendix 2.2.
- 8 Analysing the disturbances in the matrimonial market following the First World War, Halbwachs shows how 'the extremely strong reduction (by nearly a quarter) of the male population (reaching maturity between 1900 and 1915) including, by the end of the war, age categories from 23 to 38' had as its consequence 'to raise the young in the age-scale (and perhaps to lower the older by a few rungs)' (cf. M. Halbwachs, 'La nuptialité en France pendant et depuis la guerre', repr. in *Classes sociales et morphologie*, Paris, Minuit, 1972, pp. 231-74).
- 9 Thus we see that those research workers in sociology who left research to enter higher education have a higher level of training than those who stayed in research: 46 per cent of the researchers of rank B who became teachers are *agrégés* or graduates of the ENS, whereas the whole set of researchers of rank B has only 9.5 per cent of *agrégés* or graduates of the ENS. Similarly, for rank A, the proportion of *agrégés* or graduates of the ENS is respectively 50 per cent for the research workers who went into teaching and 21 per cent for the whole set of research workers.
- 10 As we have seen, in recent times, with the massive integration of the 'hors-statut' (that is, 'statusless' temporary, unqualified staff).
- 11 This gap between the forced transformation of the principles of recruitment and the preservation of the principles of promotion is

doubtless a very general phenomenon, which can be observed every time that a professional body aims to defend itself against the threat introduced by the quality and quantity of new entrants: for example, in the case of the personnel of municipal libraries (cf. B. Seibel, *Bibliothèque municipale et animation*, Paris, Dalloz, 1983, p. 95).

- 12 These statistical data are taken from an analysis of the replies to the national consultation carried out in 1969 by the Association d'Etudes pour l'Expansion de la Recherche Scientifique (on this enquiry, see appendix 1, pp. 241-2).
- 13 In a more general fashion, this enquiry shows that the teachers are all the more indifferent to a property (Latin, the *agrégation*, the *grandes écoles*) as their present standing depends less on that property, even if that standing has only been acquired thanks to the initial possession of this property.
- 14 I need hardly add that, having long denounced what I call *pessimistic functionalism* and, with the notion of the *habitus*, having provided a means of accounting for the appearance of objective teleology presented by certain collectivities, I in no way recognize myself in some of the labels, like those of 'sociologism', 'totalitarian realism' or 'hyperfunctionalism', which are sometimes applied to me (cf. F. Bourricaud, 'Contre le sociologisme: une critique et des propositions', *Revue française de sociologie*, 16, 1975, supplement, pp. 583-603, and R. Boudon, *Effets pervers et ordre social*, Paris, PUF, 1977, or more recently, I. Elster).
- 15 I am thinking, for instance, of the (incidentally very sympathetic) review of one of my books which said: 'This [linguistic] competence resembles an amount of capital, remunerated with prestige and power. Its holders defend it as one protects a market, and supervise the linguistic capital to keep it unequally shared. It is important that, over ordinary language, there should reign an erudite language, difficult of access, susceptible only of being written, published, quoted as an example.'
- 16 M. Butor, *Répertoire*, vol. 2, Paris, Minuit, pp. 214 and 228.
- 17 This error inherent in the scholarly posture is compounded when the scientific enquiry tries to comprehend in an artificial situation the acts of classification and criteria utilized.
- 18 'Who asked you to enter higher education? - Things don't present themselves in such a clear fashion. When I was a student at the Ecole Normale, the director was called M. Bouglé. He had sympathized with me and asked me to prepare a thesis. That is why he called on me to work with him for three years as assistant lecturer at the Ecole. That is what stimulated my career. At that time, access to posts in higher education was difficult' (philosophy professor, 1972).
- 19 We can recognize the conservative orientation of the Syndicat Autonome (non-aligned union) without thereby conferring a patent of progressive-

- ness on the SNEsup or on the SGEN, this whole analysis having the result of showing up what is hidden by the published oppositions.
- 20 P. Bourdieu, *La Distinction*, p. 182.
- 21 This is clear enough in the enquiry into power in the arts faculties which establishes (cf. above, chapter 3) that the distribution of the different powers is closely linked to age (which is easy to understand, since, being applied to a population defined by a minimal possession of powers, it confronts the really powerful with the potentially powerful): the young have the factors of power (the Ecole Normale, etc.) but they do not yet have all its attributes and benefits.
- 22 All these efforts were no doubt compounded in the small provincial faculties where, because of the small number of teachers, the members of rank B often assumed the same pedagogical functions as the tenured professors (teaching *agrégation* and CAPES classes, supervising masters' degree theses), reinforcing the not-unambiguous propensity towards advance identification with a professorial post. In general, we would have to analyse in greater detail this other principle of division of the field, that formed by the opposition between Paris and the provinces (the two populations we have analysed are strictly Parisian): although, as far as we know, the hierarchy of the cities corresponds roughly to the implicit hierarchy of the faculties, and although centralization makes Paris the ideal conclusion to any successful career, membership of a local society can give rise to specific and not negligible powers, and each provincial faculty has its *academic dignitaries* who, although unknown or discounted in national or international circles, participate in the agencies of local power (planning organizations, regional committees, municipal councils, etc.).
- 23 'Do you think that you should have submitted your thesis earlier? - In terms of my career, it was impossible . . . in terms of the state of readiness of the thesis . . . on the other hand, I think I could have' (history professor, 1972). And most of the professors questioned reply negatively to the question, even when they have gone on beyond what is considered as the *normal duration* (one arts professor who devoted fourteen years to preparing his thesis deploring only too long a wait between his viva and publication).
- 24 'Well, we must admit that a delay of ten years, since I took the *agrégation* in 1936 and finished my thesis at the beginning of 1947, is normal for a state thesis, it's normal in the arts, that's what we expect. . . . I haven't calculated the statistics, but, after all, it isn't a thing you can rush. Ten years, in my opinion, is a reasonable time-scale' (Greek professor, 1972).
- 25 If they are striking through their exceptional character, the accelerated careers of the outsiders are hardly apparent statistically. Everywhere the *normaliens* and the *agrégés* have careers more rapid than the other

- categories of teachers, and this gap is stronger in the social sciences (where they are fewer) than in the other disciplines: thus, in sociology, only 10 per cent of the graduates of the ENS with rank B posts are 36 or over as opposed to 23 per cent of the *agrégés* not from the ENS and 36 per cent with an ordinary university degree, whereas in the arts 41 per cent of the graduates of the ENS with rank B posts are 36 or over, against 65 per cent of the *agrégés* and 67 per cent of the faculty graduates.
- 26 We would have to analyse all the changes in the representations and the practices which this situation has caused, such as the appearance of forms of bargaining and compromise between categories (rank A and rank B) or between unions on the Universities Consultative Committee or on the CNRS, etc.

Chapter 5 The Critical Moment

- 1 H. Poincaré *Congrès de physique de 1900*, vol. 1, 1900, p. 22, quoted by G. J. Holton, *Thematic Origins of Scientific Thought*, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 1973.
- 2 On the subject of this contrast, see P. Bourdieu, 'Le marché des biens symboliques', *L'Année sociologique*, 22, 1971, pp. 49-126.
- 3 Because of the fact that the educational system tends to become the official means of apportioning the right to hold a steadily growing number of positions, and one of the means of preservation or transformation of the structure of class relations through the mediation of the maintenance or change in the number and (social) status of the holders of positions in this structure, the number of individual or collective agents (parents' associations, administration, managing directors, etc.) who are interested in its functioning and claim to modify it, because they expect it to provide satisfaction of their interests, is tending to increase. We can see indications of this process in the extension of parents' associations to the middle classes, in the creation of a new type of common association whose action is directed principally at the education system, in the presence of specific pressure groups - such as those organizing the congresses of Caen, Amiens and Orleans - uniting managers, technocrats and teachers (and, secondarily, in the place reserved for problems of education in the newspapers, which all today have their 'specialist', if not a group of them, or even the proportion of questions devoted to these problems in opinion polls).
- 4 Cf. P. Bourdieu, *Distinction*, tr. R. Nice, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 1984, p. 138. [Tr.]
- 5 These reflections and interrogations can, it seems, be used to explain any crisis (or revolution). If we fail to perceive the logic of the different fields as such, are we not tempted either to posit as self-evident the

- unity of revolutionary events or on the contrary to treat different local crises as successive moments corresponding to different groups (aristocratic, parliamentary or peasant revolution, etc.), driven by the different motors of a cumulative series of separate crises liable in the last resort to be subjected to separate explanations? If every revolution actually encloses several interconnected revolutions and thus refers us back to several causal systems, should we not in addition ask what are the causes and effects of the integration of the specific crises, etc?
- 6 On this point and especially on the specifically *statistical* logic of academic reproduction and on the unifying effects of the common experience of devaluation, see P. Bourdieu, 'Classement, déclassement, reclassement', *Actes de la recherche en sciences sociales*, 24 November 1968, p. 223, and *Distinction*.
 - 7 Thus we see that all the (numerous) explanations of the crisis of May 1968 along the lines of the conflict of generations (in the ordinary sense) have been deceived by appearances. I note in addition that the devaluation of diplomas had completely different effects according to the social origins of the agents concerned.
 - 8 Among the reasons which limit the validity of the analogy of inflation – to which I resorted in a previous phase of my work (cf. P. Bourdieu, *L'Inflation des titres scolaires*, roneotyped, Montreal, 1973) – there is the fact that the agents can counter this devaluation with individual or collective strategies, such as those which consist in producing *new markets* able to enhance their diplomas (creating new professions) or to more or less completely modify the criteria defining the right to hold the dominant positions and, concomitantly, defining the structure of these positions within the field of power.
 - 9 A *bachelier* is a holder of the *baccalauréat* (equivalent to GCE A level, and still a sufficient guarantee of university entrance in most disciplines except medicine), i.e. a successful school-leaver. [Tr.]
 - 10 [The CAP (*certificat d'aptitude professionnelle*), the professional aptitude certificate, is awarded after technical training and/or apprenticeship. (Tr.)] Cf. G. Adam, F. Bon, J. Capdevielle and R. Mouriaux, *L'Ouvrier français en 1970*, Paris, A. Colin, 1970, pp. 223–4.
 - 11 Many interactions, and even more or less durable social relations, have as their principle an objective reinforcement of those defence mechanisms of which our visions of the social world are always an element (albeit to very variable degrees).
 - 12 The return to reality, a genuine *return of the social repressed* (which has nothing to do with what is normally understood by a 'sudden realization'), and the collapse of the defences long opposed to the discovery of the objective truth of the position held, can take the form of a crisis whose violence is no doubt all the greater for having been so long deferred (cf. the 'mid-life crisis'), and which can find in the collective crisis a trigger

- and an opportunity to express itself in a more or less sublimated form (as witness all the cases of moral or political conversion associated with the crisis of May 1968).
- 13 This model does not allow us an exact understanding of individual reactions to the crisis: these depend on dispositional variables linked to social origins, on positional variables linked to the position of the discipline and the individual's position within the discipline (university status and intellectual prestige), and on conjunctural variables, especially the intensity of the crisis and of the criticism of the university institution, which depends on the discipline (and on its Parisian or provincial location) and on the positions adopted most frequently by agents of the same rank or status.
 - 14 A CEG (*collège d'enseignement général*) is a comprehensive secondary school (non-selective, unstreamed, as opposed to the *lycée*, entry to which is reserved for the most academically successful pupils). [Tr.]
 - 15 A CET (*collège d'enseignement technique*) is a technical school for non-academic pupils; an IUT (*institut universitaire de technologie*) is a university institute of technology, providing specialist higher education in science and technology to about second-year university level. [Tr.]
 - 16 Historians of the future will perhaps find in police archives the information necessary to test the model.
 - 17 To those who would see an exception in the role which a number of students of the Ecole Normale Supérieure held in subversive movements, before and during May 1968, it should suffice to recall that the period 1960–70 was marked by a decline in the academic position of the Ecole Normale and also, no doubt, in the social positions offered to its graduates – despite the increase in the appointment of *normaliens* in the faculties – which coincides with a rise in the social origins of the pupils. Thus the proportion of sons of members of the liberal professions, engineers and senior managers rose from 38 per cent between 1958 and 1965, to 42 per cent between 1966 and 1973, and 43.3 per cent between 1974 and 1977 for the ENS de la rue d'Ulm, from 14 per cent between 1956 and 1965, to 28 per cent between 1966 and 1973, and 32.2 per cent between 1974 and 1979 for the ENS de Saint-Cloud (J. N. Luc and A. Barbé, *Histoire de l'Ecole Normale Supérieure de Saint-Cloud*, Paris, Presses de la FNNSP, 1982, table 10, p. 254, and table 6, p. 248).
 - 18 It seems in general that the crisis took on quite different forms in the small faculties in the provinces, where the size of the student populations concerned and the 'reserves' of political leaders were less significant, and where, as we have seen, the relations between the grades were qualitatively very different.
 - 19 The two processes which thus find themselves *synchronized* have their *raison d'être* (at least partially) outside the field, the first in the whole set of factors determining the general expansion of access to secondary

- and higher education and the differential distribution of pupils of different social origins between the faculties and the disciplines; the second in the relationships between the different sectors of the university field and the labour market or, in other words, between the different diplomas and posts offered on the labour market at the moment under consideration, with the effects of differential 'devaluation' which affect those same diplomas and, more or less strongly according to their inherited social capital, their different owners.
- 20 In the majority of disciplines, the researchers are of higher social origins than the teachers: 58 per cent of the researchers in sociology, 52 per cent of the researchers in psychology and 56.5 per cent of the researchers in geography are from the upper classes, as opposed to 50, 40 and 40.5 per cent of the teachers in the same discipline. This is a comprehensible phenomenon, since the chances nowadays of gaining access to a career in research depend fundamentally on the possibility of maintaining oneself in the situation of a student or research assistant (which, despite grants and vacations, supposes economic dispositions and means reserved in fact for the more privileged) long enough to become established in a research unit (thanks to connections, which are also unevenly distributed) or to gain the support of an influential 'head'.
- 21 Cf. G. Canguilhem, *Idéologie et rationalité dans l'histoire des sciences de la vie*, Paris, Vrin, 1977, pp. 33-45.
- 22 We can see that the peculiar intensity of conflicts in the field of sociology is no doubt due above all to the dispersed nature of the professional body, and that we can in no case interpret this, as has often been done, as an index of a lesser degree of scientificity in the discipline.
- 23 We have shown how certain assistant lecturers in the science faculties are led to move closer towards their students and to abandon their magisterial role, in order to escape from the difficulties which are caused for them by their rivalry with the professors and the *normaliens*, whose 'threat' is often mentioned in the interviews, even though they too may be simply assistant lecturers like themselves (P. Bourdieu, 'Epreuve scolaire et consécration sociale, les classes préparatoires aux grandes écoles', *Actes de la recherche en sciences sociales*, 39, September 1981, pp. 3-70).
- 24 J.-Y. Caro, 'Formation à la recherche économique: scénario pour une réforme', *Revue économique*, 34, 4 July 1983, pp. 673-90.
- 25 The UNEF (Union National des Etudiants de France) is a left-wing students' union, generally sympathizing with the Communist Party. [Tr.]
- 26 Since we can reveal here neither the ethnological data noted in the field, which are inevitably partial and disorganized - because of the practical impossibility of totalization - nor a narrative constructed from observations and eyewitness accounts, we can only refer the reader who wants

- an evocation of the atmosphere to the pages which Flaubert devotes to the 1848 Revolution in *Sentimental Education* and especially to the subject of the practices whose *principle* is given above, the circuit of 'clubs' where 'systems of public happiness' are elaborated and where 'subversive motions' abound ('Down with academies! Down with the Institute!', etc.).
- 27 Cf. B. B. Malinovski, 'The problem of meaning in primitive languages', supplement 1; in C. K. Ogden and I. A. Richards, *The Meaning of Meaning: Study of the Influence upon Thought and of the Science of Symbolism*, London, Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1923, 10th edn, 1960, pp. 315ff: 'There can be no doubt that we have here a new type of linguistic use - phatic communion I am tempted to call it, actuated by the demon of terminological invention - a type of speech in which ties of union are created by a mere exchange of words.' [Tr.]
- 28 This is one of the reasons why political work, contrary to such naïvely utilitarian theories such as those proposed by Olson in *La Logique de Faction collective* (and whose success after 1968, notes Albert Hirschman with a certain cruelty, was no doubt due to the fact that it tended to show the impossibility of movements like May 1968), whether undertaken by the party militant in ordinary times or by demonstrators on exceptional occasions, can be its own end and its own reward: the very efforts of the struggle, not to mention the joys of militant solidarity or the feeling of duty accomplished or even of the real or imaginary experience of being able to transform the world, constitute in themselves so many indubitable satisfactions (cf. A. O. Hirschman, *Shifting Involvements: Private Interest and Public Action*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1982).
- 29 Lanson, *Histoire de la littérature française*, Paris, 1901, 7th edn, p. 1091, quoted by A. Compagnon, *La Troisième République des lettres, de Flaubert à Proust*, Paris, Seuil, 1983, p. 71.
- 30 The Hôtel Massa, the headquarters of the Société des Gens de Lettres (Writers' Society), was occupied in 1968 by a group of minor writers. The Odéon, one of France's national theatres, directed by the famous actor Jean-Louis Barrault, was occupied by students in 1968, who used it as a forum for public political debate. [Tr.]
- 31 J. de Romilly, *Nous autres professeurs*, Paris, Fayard, 1969, p. 20.
- 32 F. Robert, *Un Mandarin prend la parole*, Paris, Presses Universitaires de France, 1970, p. 48.
- 33 R. Aron, *La Révolution introuvable*, Paris, Fayard, 1968, p. 13.
- 34 Cf. *ibid.*, pp. 13, 45, 56.
- 35 De Romilly, *Nous autres professeurs*, p. 14.
- 36 *Ibid.*, p. 9.
- 37 *Ibid.*, p. 8.
- 38 *Ibid.*, p. 15.

- 39 Symbolically subordinate within the university institution, these 'gate-crashers' have expressed only very partially the questions which they put by the very fact of their presence, and the disturbance which they feel in the face of a system transformed by the very effect of their presence and their disturbance (as is clearly seen in the extreme case of children of immigrants, who put the questions most radically excluded from the normally functioning institution).
- 40 Cf. F. Gaussen, 'L'opposition proche du PC renverse la direction "gauchiste" du SNEsup', *Le Monde*, 18 March 1969.
- 41 This public display of the space of opinions takes to its maximum intensity the effect produced by public opinion polls when, through techniques as apparently innocent as the presentation of a scale of opinions or of an ensemble of pre-existing responses to a determined question, they impose an explicit problematic, that is to say a space of formal political attitudes.
- 42 The situation is a constant one for politicians (or, to a lesser degree, for intellectuals), *public men* continually sentenced to *public, published* and advertised opinion, therefore constrained to align all their opinions and their practices with their declared position in the political arena and to repress into *secrecy* any *private opinions* likely to contradict the political attitudes officially linked with the positions and with the groups which they speak for – which implies a strongly censored and euphemistic language.
- 43 One of the consequences of these analyses is to show up the naïvety of the question of 'true' opinion: opinion is defined each time in the unique relation between an expressive disposition and a market situation. And we could set ourselves the task of establishing, for each agent or class of agents, a *political profile* corresponding to the opinions they might profess (on each one of the questions politically constituted at the moment considered) as a function of the specific laws (of censorship especially) of the market considered (the enquiry situation itself is one of these markets, situated towards the pole of officialdom); and to determine according to which characteristics of the agent the *distance* between public opinions and private opinions varies.
- 44 It should suffice, to give universal relevance to these analyses, to remember the remark of Proust's Duchess of Guermantes on some salon 'which used to be so charming', that one finds 'all the people one spent one's life avoiding, simply because they happen to be against Dreyfus, and even others, of whom one has not even heard' (M. Proust, *A la recherche du temps perdu*, vol. 2, Paris, Gallimard (La Pléiade), 1954, p. 238).
- 45 Raymond Aron. [Tr.]
- 46 Here again, as at each point of this analysis, we may refer to Proust: 'Monsieur de Norpois put these questions to Bloch with a vehemence which, although it intimidated my comrade, flattered him as well; for

- the ambassador seemed to address in him a whole party, to interrogate Bloch as if he had received the confidences of this party and could assume responsibility for the decisions which would be taken. "If you refused to back down," continued Monsieur de Norpois, without waiting for Bloch's *collective reply*, "if, before the very ink on the decree which instituted the revision procedure had time to dry, obeying who knows what insidious instructions, you refused to back down, and confirmed the sterile opposition which some take to be the *ultima ratio* of politics, if you retired to your tents and burnt your boats, it would be in your own worst interest' (Proust, *A la recherche du temps perdu*, vol. 2, pp. 245–6).
- 47 In the period immediately following the crisis, the degree to which university problems are perceived as political problems, needing to be formulated and resolved in political terms, instead of remaining in the domain of the unquestioned, varies according to the faculties, the link between opinions on the university and political opinions (what we call 'politicization') being strengthened as we move from the faculties of medicine or law to the faculties of science and arts (enquiry by the AEERS, in 1969).
- 48 It has not been sufficiently noted that most of the 'May writings' are anonymous or signed with acronyms which fail to identify individual authors. The possibilities of analysis are thereby considerably reduced: one would have to be a true believer in the omnipotence of internalist analysis to hope to understand properly such writings, of which neither the authors nor the social conditions of production and reception can be characterized. This is no doubt true of many writings produced in similar circumstances.
- 49 An analysis of these *dual* systems of dispositions, with their ambiguous and unavowed ambition, would help us better understand the later success, in the press, in publishing, in public relations, in marketing and even in capitalist business, of many of the leaders of May 1968.

Postscript: The Categories of Professorial Judgement

This study was carried out with the help of Monique de Saint-Martin.

- 1 Cf. P. Bourdieu and M. de Saint-Martin, 'L'excellence scolaire et les valeurs du système d'enseignement français', *Annales*, 25, 1, January–February 1970, pp. 147–75.
- 2 A *première supérieure* is a preparatory class (*khagne* or *taupe*) for a *grande école*. [Tr.]
- 3 This practical taxonomy is revealed with particular clarity in the discourse devoted to the celebration of works of art and, more generally, the celebration of all the exclusive properties of the dominant class (cf. P.

- Bourdieu, 'Les fractions de la classe dominante et les modes d'appréciation de l'œuvre d'art', *Information sur les sciences sociales*, 13, 3, pp. 7-32.
- 4 Corresponding to 'pure' or 'applied' options in the *baccalauréat*. [Tr.]
 - 5 We will willingly accept Lacan's argument that 'Chamfort's formula, "that we can bet on the fact that any public idea, any agreed convention, is foolish, for it has attracted the majority", will certainly appeal to all those who think they escape its laws, that is, precisely, the majority' (J. Lacan, *Ecrits*, Paris, Seuil, 1966, p. 21). As long as we add: the majority of those treated by the social and academic system as an elite.
 - 6 The only accents ever mentioned in the obituaries are accents deviating from the norm, and, among them, 'southern' accents: 'His rough Pyrenean accent, with rolled r's and double consonants' (obituary on G. Rumeau, born at Arbeost, Hautes Pyrénées, son of a primary teacher, *Annuaire ENS*, 1962, p. 42); 'A strong voice, unperturbed by its regional resonance' (notice on A. Montserrat, born at Castres, Tarn, *Annuaire ENS*, 1963, p. 51).
 - 7 Obituary notice on Robert Francillon, *Annuaire ENS*, 1974, p. 46.
 - 8 Obituary notice on Louis Reau, *Annuaire ENS*, 1962, p. 29.
 - 9 It is relatively arbitrary to dissociate the human qualities of the professors from their intellectual qualities, so great is professorial endogamy. From the enquiry which we carried out in 1964 on the matrimonial strategies of six matriculation years (1948-53) of literary *normaliens* (N = 155, that is, a rate of reply of 83 per cent), it appears that among the married *normaliens* who represent 85 per cent of the whole set, 59 per cent married a teacher, 58 per cent of the men who married a teacher married an *agrégée*, 49 per cent of the men who married an *agrégée* married a graduate of the Ecole Normale Supérieure de Sèvres (as for the others, their wives have intellectual professions in 4 per cent of the cases, are middle-ranking executives in 2 per cent of the cases, have no profession at the time of the enquiry in 28 per cent of the cases). We can hardly overemphasize the degree to which this kind of matrimonial strategy contributes to the closing in upon itself of the overprotected world of the academic.
 - 10 *Annuaire ENS*, 1962, pp. 36-7, 52-3, 38-9, 54-5.
 - 11 This series is a good empirical indicator of the market value of the title of *normalien*, and it is from a more or less exact knowledge of the 'exchange rate' of the diploma that is expressed in it that is constituted the subjective vision of the field of opportunities which defines the aspirations and expectations of a given moment in time. On the relation between career and field of opportunities, see P. Bourdieu, 'Avenir de classe et causalité du probable', *Revue française de sociologie*, 15, 1, January-March 1971, pp. 3-12, especially p. 11.
 - 12 Never praised as a value worth pursuing in its own right, obscurity can only be recognized in the guise of the positive virtues which it is

- supposed to imply, the disdain for honours and the renunciation of non-academic success. As witness this phrase, flung twenty years ago by a Sorbonne professor at the head of a candidate known outside the milieu for his essays and journalism: 'You are not unknown enough.'
- 13 Obituary notice on Jacques-Henri Passeron, *Annuaire ENS*, 1974, p. 120.
 - 14 Obituary notice on Paul Blassel, *Annuaire ENS*, 1962, p. 41.
 - 15 The analysis of a sample of academics and writers or artists mentioned in *Who's Who in France* (1969-70 editions) shows a group of systematic differences between these two populations. The academics are characterized by a much higher average number of children (2.39) than the writers and artists (1.56), a lower proportion of the unmarried or divorced (0.9 and 0.9 per cent respectively as opposed to 16.6 and 10.7 per cent), a much higher proportion of decorations (65.1 per cent of the academics have the Legion of Honour as opposed to 39.2 per cent of the intellectuals).
 - 16 Obituary notice on Jules Romains, *Annuaire ENS*, 1974, p. 43.
 - 17 Obituary notice on Guillaume Rumeau, professor of physics in a preparatory class, *Annuaire ENS*, 1962.
 - 18 *Annuaire ENS*, 1965, p. 38.
 - 19 Obituary notice on Aurélien Digeon, *Annuaire ENS*, 1963, p. 58.
 - 20 M. Weber, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, 2nd edn, London, George Allen and Unwin, 1976.

Appendix 1 The Sources Used

- 1 The *brevet supérieur* is the lower school certificate for those leaving at age 15 instead of staying on to take the *baccalauréat* at 18. [Tr.]
- 2 Cf. P. Bourdieu and M. de Saint-Martin, 'La Sainte Famille: L'Episcopat français dans le champ du pouvoir', *Actes de la recherche en sciences sociales*, 44-5, November 1982, pp. 2-53.
- 3 A *CHU* (*centre hospitalier universitaire*) is a university clinical school. [Tr.]
- 4 Each French government minister has his own 'cabinet' of civil servants and/or experts to advise him. [Tr.]
- 5 The CNESER is the Conseil National de l'Enseignement Supérieur de la Recherche. [Tr.]
- 6 The National Committee for Scientific Research. [Tr.]
- 7 The Study Group for the Expansion of Scientific Research. [Tr.]

Appendix 2 The Morphological Transformations of the Faculties and The Morphological Transformations of the Disciplines

The complete set of data can be found in P. Bourdieu, L. Botanski and P. Maldidier, 'La défense du corps', *Information sur les sciences sociales*, 10, 4, 1971, pp. 54-86.

- 1 The CPEM, the *certificat de préparation aux études médicales*, and the PCB (*Physique, Chimie, Biologie*), the preliminary certificate for medical studies in physics, chemistry and biology, are diplomas enabling students after the first year of general scientific studies at university to specialize in medical studies. [Tr.]

Appendix 3 The Hit Parade of French Intellectuals

- 1 Of the 448 'judges', we may identify, if we rely on the classificatory system used by *Lire*, 132 'journalists' (92 for the 'written press', 40 for 'radio and television'), 66 writers, 34 with 'professions in the book trade' (publishers, booksellers, etc.), 34 'teacher-writers', 21 'academicians' (to which should be added 44 with professions in the 'arts and performing arts', 14 'politicians', 43 'teachers', 34 'students' and 16 'various'). In fact, the first four categories (which represent nearly two-thirds of the 'judges') include a very high proportion of hybrid characters, who escape the classification proposed: the authors who are classified with the 'journalists' have nearly all written at least one book and, according to this criterion, could be put in the category of 'writers'. This is pointed out by the creators of the classification, who omit on the other hand to note that the majority of authors classified under 'writers' also have more or less permanent and institutionalized links with the daily or weekly press. This difference in treatment shows the hierarchy tacitly established between the two 'conditions': one should apologize to the 'writers' whom one reduces to the status of 'journalist'; one has no need to apologize for promoting a journalist to the status of writer. As for the 'teacher-writers', nearly half of them could just as easily be classified in the category (not used by *Lire*) of 'journalist-academics' which, while it hardly existed thirty years ago, is now very rich, and we could also put in it some of the authors who, although their main source of income is teaching, have been classified by *Lire* among the 'journalists' (we have not attempted here to present lists of proper names, to avoid giving our demonstration the appearance of a denunciation).
- 2 In the list of the 'bestsellers of the last seven years [Giscard's term as President] drawn up by the weekly *L'Express* in March 1981 according

- to the number of weeks in the list of weekly bestsellers, Roger Garaudy comes in thirteenth place for *Appel aux vivants* - after Jakez Hélias, Peyrefitte (for *Le Mal français*), Schwartzberg, Viansson-Ponté, R. Moody, Peyrefitte (for *Quand la Chine se réveillera*), Emilie Carles, Dr Roger Dalet, Lapierre-Collins, Murray Kendall, Pisar, Solzenitsyn, Troyat, de Closets - and in eleventh place for *Parole d'homme*; Bernard-Henri Lévy comes in twentieth place, for his *Testament de Dieu*, and Glucksmann in twenty-first for *Les Maîtres penseurs*. The bestseller effect is particularly noticeable, as we see, in the domain of the social sciences and philosophy; no doubt because the frontier between works of research and essays is vaguer there, at least in the eyes of the journalists and the general public (whom they help to orientate): none of the novelists, poets or men of the theatre quoted in the hit parade published by *Lire* appears in the list of bestselling novels. Further down the list, we find more works that Janick Jossin (*L'Express*, 18 April 1981) calls 'unexpected bestsellers' (for instance, *Montaillou* by Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie, *Plaidoyer pour une Europe décadente* by Raymond Aron or *Fragments d'un discours amoureux* by Roland Barthes). Janick Jossin also cites, for the novel, Michel Tournier, Marguerite Yourcenar, J. M. G. Le Clézio, Julien Gracq.
- 3 As a result of competition between the different organs of the press, each cultural journalist tends to act as 'taste-maker' for all the other journalists. Moreover, some institutions provide journalists with *objectified criteria*: "Throughout this seven-year period, French literature has followed the movements of these two semi-official barometers that the television broadcast "Apostrophes" and the list of bestsellers in *L'Express* have become" Jossin, *L'Express*, 18 April 1981). Thus it is that there tends to arise a hierarchy of intellectuals specific to journalists and a special category of intellectuals-for-the-media (the *Lire* hit parade recording as it were the product of an action of which it itself represents the most accomplished form).
 - 4 All the unwitting question-begging that it is possible to deploy (predetermined definition, implicitly biased sample, etc.) may be found in Charles Kadushin's book, which has all the social gloss required to make it a classic of 'empirical' sociology for intellectuals (cf. C. Kadushin, *The American Intellectual Elite*, Boston, Little Brown and Co., 1974).
 - 5 One of the main differences between the viewpoint of contemporaries and the viewpoint of posterity lies no doubt in the fact that contemporaries have a (variable) knowledge of the authors, of their physical person, and also of everything implied by contemporaneity, gossip, rumour, personal mythology. And this *intuitus personae* which constitutes one of principles of our primary perception and appreciation of authors (more than the works, no doubt little read by those whose profession it is to speak about them in the press) and of the difference from later

- perception and appreciation, more directly and exclusively based on *reading* the work, is very difficult to reconstitute through eyewitness accounts (for instance, notes on the speech accents of nineteenth-century painters or writers, on their bodily *hexis*, their appearance and behaviour, etc., are very rare and always associated with exceptional cases).
- 6 Thus it is probable that the bias in favour of journalist-intellectuals or writers with 'media muscle' would have been even more marked if a longer list had been asked for, leaving greater scope for the strategy of pandemic infiltration.
- 7 The hit parade of intellectuals, which, unlike the enquiry by Huret in 1881, which attempted only to record the opinions of writers on writers, is the product of an explicit intention to judge and classify, and the privilege which it grants to the most 'mediagenic' authors, are only some indications of the growth of this control: suffice it to add the institutional weight that the journalist-intellectuals have acquired within an academic institution such as the Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes or the very fact that the 'cultural journalists' of the major dailies and weeklies, armed with only the authority conferred on them by their supposed power to procure fame beyond the field of publishing and the press and their real ability to produce within the limits of their field, especially in publishing houses, can collectively affirm their claim legitimately to judge works (generically called 'essays') whose examination and criticism was in former times reserved for the scientific field and learned reviews (cf. *Les Nouvelles littéraires*, 3-9 January 1980).
- 8 It is remarkable, as has been noted by those responsible for the enquiry themselves, that Aron is 'the name cited by those who would prefer to cite nobody' (J. Jaubert, *Lire*, 68, April 1981, p. 45): 'My good man, there no longer are any influential intellectuals, except, at a pinch, Raymond Aron' (Yves Berger), 'apart from Raymond Aron' (Alain Buhler), 'Aron, if you think really hard', says Annie Copperman, who adds: 'The media have taken over.' This is corroborated by Jacques Lanzmann when he cites 'Bernard-Henri Lévy, whose really original and penetrating ideas are backed up by fine telegenic features.' It all looks as if, by crowning the most anti-intellectual intellectual, the intention was to dethrone intellectuals as such or, better, negate them - an intention which is also expressed in the urgency of journalists of all persuasions to declare that Sartre has no successor, or again in the propensity to welcome defenders of the different forms of irrationalism, of which we hardly need ask whether they have encouraged the submission of the intellectual field to the problems and the procedures of journalism, or whether they have caused it, so certain is it that they are linked to the creation of a new social definition of the 'intellectual', making rational exploitation of the 'media', with everything that implies, one of the conditions of the ability to dominate the intellectual field.

- 9 For an exemplary analysis, which is easy to transpose, see M. Goldman, *Literary Dissent in Communist China*, Cambridge, Mass., Harvard University Press, 1967.
- 10 We know that certain ethnologists have observed that accusations of sorcery appear in social worlds where relations are at once ill defined and competitive, and where tensions between rivals cannot be otherwise resolved (cf. M. Douglas (ed.), *Witchcraft, Confessions and Accusations*, London, Tavistock, 1970).